



ASSOCIATION OF REINTEGRATION  
OF CRIMEA

France, Paris, 14 Avenue de l'Opera, 75001  
Ukraine, Kyiv, 56 Kharkivske highroad, 02175  
arcconstructionofcrimea@gmail.com  
17.02.2022 № 036/2022

**To UN High Commissioner for Human Rights**

**Situation with education for girls in the Crimea**

*DrHab, Prof. Borys Babin, PhD Hanna Ustinova-Boichenko, PhD Olexiy Plotnikov,  
PhD Andrii Chvaliuk, PhD Victor Filatov, experts of ARC*

Our Association of Reintegration of Crimea (ARC)<sup>1</sup>, as non-governmental expert and human rights organisation<sup>2</sup>, with activities devoted to Crimea's issues, submits this application to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights fro its report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the realization of the equal enjoyment of the right to education by every girl, highlighting the most important challenges and barriers that girls face and making recommendations.

Our responses are devoted to the situation with education for girls in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and city of Sevastopol (hereinafter – the Crimea); it deals with the issues identified by the Association in its work, namely the issue of intentional and organised Russian policy against rights to education and development, also as for gender and racial discrimination committed in the Crimea since 2014.

Illegal occupation and attempted annexation of Crimea by Russia since 2014 have been condemned in a set of international acts, including UN GA resolutions 2014 68/262, 2016 71/205, 2017 72/190, 2018 73/263 2019 74/168, 2020 75/192, 2021 76/70, 2018 73/194, 2019 74/17, 2020 75/29, 2021 76/179<sup>3</sup>, resolutions of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe 1988 (2014), 2028 (2015), 2067 (2015), 2112 (2016), 2132 (2016), 2145 (2017), 2198 (2018), 2231 (2018) etc., of the European Parliament's resolutions 2014/2841 (RSP), 2014/2965 (RSP), 2016/2556 (RSP), 2016/2692 (RSP), 2017/2596 (RSP), 2017/2869 (RSP), 2018/2754 (RSP), 2018/2870 (RSP), 2019/2734 (RSP), 2019/2202 (INI) etc. Attempted annexation the Crimea by Russia was never recognized by the international community. Human rights violations in the Crimea now are the subject to consideration in international courts, including the International Court of Justice (case 166)<sup>4</sup> and the European Court of Human Rights (case 20958/14 and others).<sup>5</sup> International Court of Justice in case 166 demanded Russia by its order on 19 April 2017

<sup>1</sup> <https://arc.construction/>

<sup>2</sup> [https://www.journal-officiel.gouv.fr/associations/detail-annonce/associations\\_b/20210005/1348](https://www.journal-officiel.gouv.fr/associations/detail-annonce/associations_b/20210005/1348)

<sup>3</sup> for example, <https://undocs.org/en/A/RES/76/179>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.icj-cij.org/public/files/case-related/166/166-20191108-JUD-01-00-EN.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/eng?i=001-207622>

demanded Russia to ensure the availability of education in the Ukrainian language in the Crimea<sup>6</sup> that was not executed later in any way.

*Association gives such information for the questions, pointed by the OCHCR:*

1. Russian humanitarian, social and financial 'policy' in the Crimea caused, since 2014, strong negative impact on the health care and educational systems of the peninsula.

In 2014 Russia started a "medical reform" in Crimea and implemented its "own insurance medicine model"<sup>7</sup>. In 2020, this resulted in the absence of adequate quantity of medical personnel in Crimean hospitals<sup>8</sup> that minimized the possibility of effective medical aid to the residents of Crimea<sup>9,10</sup>, and violated their right to health and right to life guaranteed by multilateral human rights multilateral. At the same time Russia as occupier-State has an obligation under Geneva Convention IV to ensure adequate medical aid to the population of Crimea, which is bluntly violated by its ineffective medical policies.

Regarding to some so-called "official" statistics, published by Russia-controlled "Crimean and Sevastopol department" of its Federal Statistic Service, the part of Crimean residents that have a "healthy kind of life" decreased from 29.2 % in 2019 to 16.3 in 2021<sup>11</sup>. Quantity of medical institutions in the Crimea decreased from 117 in 2014 to 68 in 2020, among them special children hospitals from 6 to 4; quantity of Crimean polyclinics, separated from other structures, decreased in 2014-2020 from 56 to 19; quantity of hospital beds in 24-hour hospitals in Crimea decreased in 2014-2020 from 16328 to 15803 and of beds for pregnant women, women in childbirth and puerperas decreased from 938 to 588; quantity of paramedic-obstetric stations in Crimea decreased in 2014-2020 from 504 to 493<sup>12</sup>.

Regarding to such "official" statistics during 2014-2020 the common quantity of Crimean medic personal increased but in part of number of some "other categories" like military medic personnel; quantity of dermato-venereologists, regarding Russia's army presence in region, also increased, from 134 to 155<sup>13</sup>. But, for example, quantity of Crimean pediatricians decreased from 740 to 705, and of social hygienists and health organizers – from 447 to 307<sup>14</sup>; quantity of obstetrician in the Crimea decreased in 2014-2020 from 902 to 710 persons<sup>15</sup>.

It is practically impossible to find figures of deaths' reasons and incidence dynamics in the Crimea, but regarding Sevastopol "official" data the new-established oncology cases number increased in 2014-2020 from 5505 to 5861 and number of new-established congenital anomalies (malformations), deformities and chromosomal abnormalities increased in Sevastopol from 353 in 2014 to 1629 in 2020<sup>16</sup>. So the COVID situation caused collapse in all areas of life in peninsula, including the education.

Since 2014, Russia bans usage of medical drugs certified by the Ukrainian authorities, including antibiotic and antivirus medicals produced in European countries and allowed for usage in Ukraine<sup>17</sup>. Instead, Russia provided Crimean medical institutions and pharmacies

<sup>6</sup> <https://www.icj-cij.org/public/files/case-related/166/166-20170419-ORD-01-00-EN.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <https://arc.construction/14919>

<sup>8</sup> <https://arc.construction/8847>

<sup>9</sup> <https://arc.construction/15547>

<sup>10</sup> <https://arc.construction/3773>

<sup>11</sup> [https://crimea.gks.ru/storage/mediabank/2.9.4.%20Доля%20граждан%20ведущих%20здоровый%20образ%20жизни\(1\).pdf](https://crimea.gks.ru/storage/mediabank/2.9.4.%20Доля%20граждан%20ведущих%20здоровый%20образ%20жизни(1).pdf)

<sup>12</sup> <https://crimea.gks.ru/storage/mediabank/BNSm8YDK/+Основные%20показатели%20здравоохранения%202014-2020.pdf>

<sup>13</sup> <https://arc.construction/25876>

<sup>14</sup> <https://crimea.gks.ru/storage/mediabank/bVyVC718/+Численность%20врачей%20по%20специальностям%202014-2020.pdf>

<sup>15</sup> <https://crimea.gks.ru/storage/mediabank/7C9WGjee/+Средний%20медперсонал%202014-2020.pdf>

<sup>16</sup> <https://crimea.gks.ru/storage/mediabank/классы%20болезней.pdf>

<sup>17</sup> <https://arc.construction/5967>

with own-produced drugs, often of extremely low quality. Furthermore, Russian “authorities” ban citizens from carrying high-quality medical drugs from Ukraine’s mainland, which is punishable as “smuggling”, including confiscation of drugs<sup>18</sup>. In 2020, Russia banned all anti-COVID vaccines in Crimea<sup>19</sup>, except those which are produced in the Russia without internationally recognized certification procedure (like “Sputnik” vaccine)<sup>20</sup>. To make things worse, the vaccination of Crimean inhabitants by the Russian non-certified vaccine is de-facto obligatory for citizens, including all levels of education<sup>21,22</sup>. ARC believes that such policies bear features of a medical experiment over the population of the occupied territory<sup>23</sup>. This is another impermissible violation of the Geneva Convention IV. This also violates the rights of Crimean residents to health, to life and to privacy, as well as prohibition of degrading treatment and enforced medical experiments, guaranteed by multilateral human rights treaties.

Russia’s de-facto “authorities” in Crimea did not take action to prevent and address racial discrimination<sup>24</sup>, hate speech, xenophobia<sup>25</sup>, and related intolerance<sup>26</sup> including in the COVID-19 context. Racial discrimination of ethnic Ukrainians and indigenous Crimean Tatars in Crimea, including IDPs is now subject to consideration in the International Court of Justice<sup>27</sup>. Russia violated the right to freedom of movement by systematic blockade of all three ABL checkpoints used to enter and exit Ukraine’s mainland due to “COVID-related quarantine measures”.

All Russian policies and measures “to minimize health risks associated with the COVID-19”<sup>28</sup> by blocking the visits of Crimean residents to Ukraine’s mainland<sup>29</sup> and of IDPs to Crimea<sup>30</sup> are not effective even potentially, since in 2020-2021 the Russia’s “authorities” organized mass visits of Russian tourists to Crimea (more than one million in the summer-2020)<sup>31,32</sup>, the resettlement of own residents to Crimea (more than sixty thousands of Russians have been resettled to Sevastopol alone in 2020)<sup>33</sup>, and by massive military trainings (more than twenty thousands Russian soldiers were re-dislocated from Russia to Crimea only in the first half of 2021)<sup>34</sup>. Such blockade violates the practice possibility of Crimean girls take part in the educational procedures on the mainland of Ukraine.

The Russian “anti-COVID” policy in Crimea violates the right to sustainable development, guaranteed by the above-pointed multilateral treaties. Russia’s “authorities” did not adopt the “COVID-19 socio-economic response and recovery plan”<sup>35,36</sup> and do not use the human rights-based approach<sup>37</sup> in pandemic-related issues<sup>38</sup>, they do not use the human rights

<sup>18</sup> <https://arc.construction/8252>

<sup>19</sup> <https://arc.construction/5003>

<sup>20</sup> <https://arc.construction/15669>

<sup>21</sup> <https://arc.construction/4829>

<sup>22</sup> <https://arc.construction/9108>

<sup>23</sup> <https://arc.construction/5074>

<sup>24</sup> <https://arc.construction/11306>

<sup>25</sup> <https://arc.construction/15537>

<sup>26</sup> <https://arc.construction/5788>

<sup>27</sup> <https://www.icj-cij.org/public/files/case-related/166/166-20191108-JUD-01-00-EN.pdf>

<sup>28</sup> <https://arc.construction/1537?lang=ru>

<sup>29</sup> <https://arc.construction/5037?lang=ru>

<sup>30</sup> <https://arc.construction/12003?lang=ru>

<sup>31</sup> <https://arc.construction/15317?lang=ru>

<sup>32</sup> <https://arc.construction/1239?lang=ru>

<sup>33</sup> <https://www.blackseanews.net/read/176965>

<sup>34</sup> <https://arc.construction/12823?lang=ru>

<sup>35</sup> <https://arc.construction/4052?lang=ru>

<sup>36</sup> <https://arc.construction/8106?lang=ru>

<sup>37</sup> <https://arc.construction/2597?lang=ru>

and gender-sensitive indicators<sup>39</sup> in this area<sup>40</sup>. Russia's "authorities" do not protect human rights of the population of Crimea, including IDPs, in the COVID-19 context<sup>41</sup>. Such "powers" violate their right to health, housing, education, information, social protection, basic services, safe and dignified return and sustainable reintegration<sup>42</sup>.

*All those issues violates negatively on right of Crimean girls to get pre-primary, primary and secondary education in the peninsula.* The main challenges on the level of pre-primary education is the limitation of places in the kindergartens due to the massive resettlement of Russian colonizers and military men together with their families to the peninsula, also as due to total corruption and negligence in area of repairing and building the kindergartens<sup>43</sup>. Also the hate speech and even the militarisation of educational process in the kindergartens took place in the Crimea<sup>44</sup>. The primary and secondary school level in the Crimea are connected with total militarisation of education<sup>45</sup>, erasing the identity of ethnic Ukrainian and Crimean Tatars, with low quality of educational process<sup>46</sup>.

The level of "high school" adds a total corruption in this area reflected details in our Association's investigations.<sup>474849</sup> For example, bosses on the so-called "Crimean Federal University" had stolen in 2016-2020 more than 6.5 billion roubles on the fictive security services; and in the same time absence of such security services in reality was a real factor of tragic massacre in the Russia-controlled "Kerch Polytechnic College", as a school shooting and bomb attack that occurred in Kerch, Crimea, on 17 October 2018. Then allegedly 18-year-old Vladislav Roslyakov shot and killed 20 people and wounded 70 others in the "College" before committing suicide. There was a five young girls among killed, exactly Anna Zhuravleva 19 years old, Ksenia Boldina, 17 years old, Victoria Demchuk 16 years old, Alina Kerova 16 years old and Daria Chegerest, 16 years old.

So all levels of the girls' education in the Crimea do not contain such features as availability, accessibility, acceptability and adaptability of education.

It would be beneficial if that OHCHR research could pay more attention to the situation with the education for girls in zones on conflict and foreign education like modern Crimea.

The reports of the UN Human Rights Monitoring Mission in Ukraine may be suitable for this issue also; we may recommend to this UN Mission monitor more actively the issues of human rights' violations done by the Russia's de-facto "authorities" in the Crimea, especially regarding gender and racial dimension, rights of children, indigenous rights, educational rights and right to sustainable development.

17<sup>th</sup> February, 2022

Representative of the Association of Reintegration of Crimea  
Dr. Borys Babin

<sup>38</sup> <https://arc.construction/8765?lang=ru>

<sup>39</sup> <https://arc.construction/15590>

<sup>40</sup> <https://arc.construction/10479>

<sup>41</sup> <https://arc.construction/7082?lang=ru>

<sup>42</sup> <https://arc.construction/12411>

<sup>43</sup> <https://arc.construction/23693>

<sup>44</sup> <https://arc.construction/25848>

<sup>45</sup> <https://arc.construction/13633>

<sup>46</sup> <https://arc.construction/25617>

<sup>47</sup> <https://arc.construction/11602>

<sup>48</sup> <https://arc.construction/20989>

<sup>49</sup> <https://arc.construction/25030>

