

Report of the Consultative Group to the President of the Human Rights Council relating to the vacancies of mandate holders to be appointed at the forty-seventh session of the Human Rights Council

Addendum 2: Mandates on violence against women and on enforced or involuntary disappearances

25 June 2021

I. Background

1. In paragraphs 47 and 49 of the annex to its resolution 5/1, the Human Rights Council decided to establish a Consultative Group comprised of Permanent Representatives appointed by Regional Groups and serving in their personal capacity. The Consultative Group is mandated by the Council to propose to the President a list of candidates who possess the highest qualifications for the mandate in question and meet the general criteria and particular requirements. Recommendations to the President of the Human Rights Council are required to be made public and substantiated pursuant to paragraph 50 of the annex to resolution 5/1.

2. The members of the Consultative Group for the selection of mandate holders to be appointed at the forty-seventh session of the Human Rights Council are: His Excellency Mr. Makaila Ahmad (Chad),¹ His Excellency Mr. Joaquín Alexander Maza Martelli (El Salvador), His Excellency Mr. Ahmad Faisal Muhamad (Malaysia) and Ms. Tamara Mawhinney (Canada).² The member of the Group from Eastern European States is yet to be nominated. The working cycle of the current Consultative Group commenced on 1 April 2021 and will end on 31 March 2022, pursuant to paragraph 1(b) of Council decision 30/115. The Group held its initial organizational meeting on 1 April 2021.

3. A total of seven vacancies of special procedure mandate holders are to be filled at the Council's forty-seventh session as follows (listed in alphabetical order):

- 1. Independent Expert on the effects of foreign debt and other related international financial obligations of States on the full enjoyment of all human rights, particularly economic, social and cultural rights (HRC res. 46/8)³**
- 2. Independent Expert on the enjoyment of human rights of persons with albinism (HRC res. 46/12)**
- 3. Special Rapporteur on the right to privacy (HRC res. 46/16)**
- 4. Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences (HRC res. 41/17)**
- 5. Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent, member from Asia-Pacific States (HRC res. 45/24)**

¹ The Coordinator of Human Rights Issues for the Group of African States informed the Secretariat, by note verbale dated 11 June 2021, that H.E. Mr. Mxolisi Nkosi, Permanent Representative of South Africa, would replace H.E. Mr. Makaila Ahmad during the temporary unavailability of the latter.

² The Group of Western European and other States (WEOG) initially nominated H.E. Ms. Leslie Norton (Canada) to serve in the Consultative Group for the entire cycle. Subsequently, the Regional Group decided to replace the original nominee with Ms. Tamara Mawhinney (Canada).

³ The vacancy was not initially foreseen and arose due to the resignation of the current mandate holder, Ms. Yuefen Li (China), on 28 March 2021.

- 6. Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent, member from Eastern European States (HRC res. 45/24)**
- 7. Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, member from Western European and other States (HRC res. 45/3)**

4. In its letter dated 25 May, the Consultative Group informed the President of the Human Rights Council of its decision to present its report with recommendations relating to three of the seven mandates in an addendum to its report due to the very short time available for launching the call for applications for the unforeseen vacancy and the longer finalization of the interview process linked to difficulties in reaching a quorum for the shortlisting of the applicants and the decision-making due to the current incomplete membership of the Consultative Group.

5. Accordingly, on 2 June 2021, the Consultative Group presented its main report⁴ to the President of the Human Rights Council with its list of candidates recommended to the President for the following four mandates:

- 1. Independent Expert on the enjoyment of human rights of persons with albinism**
- 2. Special Rapporteur on the right to privacy**
- 3. Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent, member from Asia-Pacific States**
- 4. Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent, member from Eastern European States.**

6. On 14 June 2021, the Consultative Group presented addendum 1⁵ to the report, to be read in conjunction with the main report of the Consultative Group dated 2 June 2021, which contained the recommendations of the Consultative Group in relation to the following unforeseen mandate:

- 1. Independent Expert on the effects of foreign debt and other related international financial obligations of States on the full enjoyment of all human rights, particularly economic, social and cultural rights**

7. The present addendum 2 to the report, to be read in conjunction with the main report of the Consultative Group dated 2 June 2021 and the addendum 1 dated 14 June 2021, contains the recommendations of the Consultative Group in relation to the following two remaining mandates:

- 1. Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences**
- 2. Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, member from Western European and other States**

II. Process

8. The application period for the submission of applications for the two vacancies opened on 2 March and closed on 13 April 2021 (12 noon Geneva time).

9. The Consultative Group considered 39 individual applications from 39 eligible candidates submitted for the two aforementioned vacancies in accordance with the relevant paragraphs of Human Rights Council resolution 16/21. The applications of the eligible candidates were made public on the designated web page⁶ of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

⁴ https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/SP/CallApplications/HRC47/CG_REPORT_HRC47_to_President_2021_06_02.pdf .

⁵ https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/SP/CallApplications/HRC47/CG_REPORT_HRC47Add1_IEFD_to_President_2021_06_14.pdf .

⁶ See <https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/HRC/SP/Pages/HRC47.aspx> .

(OHCHR) as provided for in paragraph 22 (b) of the annex to Council resolution 16/21 and paragraph 26 of President's statement PRST OS/14/2 (see annex I of this report).

10. The Consultative Group followed the same methodology as for the four vacancies covered in its main report dated 2 June 2021. Reference is made to paragraphs 8, 12, 13, 15, 16, 18 and 19.

11. The Consultative Group held four formal in-person meetings on 17 and 18 June 2021 to consider and interview candidates for the aforementioned vacancies. H.E. Mr. Makaila Ahmad participated in the shortlisting and was replaced by H.E. Mr. Mxolisi Nkosi in the interviews for these mandates.

12. In accordance with paragraph 13 of President's statement PRST OS/14/2, Ms. Tamara Mawhinney (Canada) recused herself from participating in the deliberation and decision-making process of these mandates as candidates of her same nationality were under consideration.

13. The Group held a total of twelve interviews with twelve shortlisted candidates for the two aforementioned mandates (see annex II of this report for the alphabetical list of interviewees). These interviews occurred on 17 and 18 June 2021, pursuant to paragraph 22 (c) of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 16/21. Each candidate was asked similar questions based on the relevant provisions of Council resolution 5/1, decision 6/102, resolution 16/21, President's statement PRST OS/14/2 and Council resolution relating to the specific mandate under consideration.

14. The Consultative Group carried out interviews by video calls. The Consultative Group expressed its preoccupation that the frequent technical difficulties, experienced in the past while carrying out interviews with interpretation through the platform Interpretify, may have discouraged candidates to avail themselves of interpretation. The Consultative Group reiterated that candidates requesting interpretation should be provided with effective technology and efficient technical assistance to be able to carry out the interviews in any official language of their choice.

15. The decisions of the Consultative Group were taken by consensus.

III. Candidates proposed by the Consultative Group to the President for the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences

16. The meetings held by the Consultative Group in relation to this mandate were chaired by H.E. Mr. Mxolisi Nkosi (South Africa). There were 27 eligible candidates for this vacancy. Of the eight candidates interviewed, the Consultative Group decided to recommend the following three candidates as best qualified to fulfil the mandate.

1. Reem ALSALEM (F) (Jordan)

2. Sima SAMAR (F) (Afghanistan)

3. Nandini AZAD (F) (India)

17. **Reem Alsalem** is an independent consultant on gender issues, human rights of migrants and transitional justice issues. She has consulted extensively for United Nations departments, agencies and programmes such as UN-Women, OHCHR, UNICEF and IOM, as well as for non-governmental organizations and academia. Previously, she worked as an international civil servant, serving with UNHCR in several countries and obtained extensive experience in international affairs, human rights, humanitarian response as well as in negotiations with a variety of stakeholders. She has a Master's in Human Rights Law from the University of Oxford, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, and a Master's in International Relations from the American University in Cairo, Egypt. Ms. Alsalem confirmed that, if she were to be appointed to the mandate, she would relinquish any

activity, advisory positions or board memberships, should a conflict of interest arise. The Consultative Group noted her substantive and in particular field experience in the United Nations system in the area of the mandate, as well as her vision for its further development.

18. **Sima Samar** has been the Chairperson of Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission for 17 years, served as Deputy Chairperson and Minister of Women's Affairs in the Interim Administration of Afghanistan from 2001 to 2003, and as Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Sudan from 2005 to 2009. She collaborated with various Special Representatives of the Secretary-General in Afghanistan. Ms. Samar was trained as medical doctor at the University of Kabul, Afghanistan. During her career she received several prizes and honorary PhDs. The Consultative Group noted her expertise and experience in the area of the mandate as well as her lifelong professional and personal engagement in the fight to end violence against women worldwide.

19. **Nandini Azad** is the elected President of the Working Women's Forum and President of the Indian Cooperative Network for Women, which is a mass movement providing micro-loans to poor women workers. She is also the Chairperson of the Independent Commission for People's Rights and Development, a national advocacy coalition to protect the rights and development of the poor. She worked as a technical consultant with the Women's Ministry of India and was a consultant with the Asian Development Bank. She holds a PhD in anthropology from Syracuse University, United States of America, and a Master's from the Centre for South and South East Asian Studies at Madras University, India. The Consultative Group noted her enthusiasm and dedication to fighting poverty and gender based violence.

IV. Candidates proposed by the Consultative Group to the President for the Working Group on enforced or involuntary disappearances, member from the Western European and other States

20. The meetings held by the Consultative Group in relation to this mandate were chaired by H.E. Mr. Joaquín Alexander Maza Martelli (El Salvador). There were 12 eligible candidates for this vacancy. Of the four candidates interviewed, the Consultative Group decided to recommend the following three candidates as best qualified to fulfil the mandate.

1. Gabriella CITRONI (F) (Italy)

2. René PROVOST (M) (Canada)

3. Susan M. AKRAM (F) (United States of America)

21. **Gabriella Citroni** is researcher in International Law and Adjunct Professor of International Human Rights Law at the University of Milano-Bicocca, Italy, and lectures at the Geneva Academy of Humanitarian Law and Human Rights, Switzerland. She imparted courses on international human rights and transitional justice as invited professor at universities in several countries. She has been working as consultant for international organizations, human rights mechanisms, including the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances and the Committee on Enforced Disappearances, and non-governmental organizations. She published extensively on enforced disappearances. She holds a PhD in International Organizations from the University of Teramo, Italy, a Law Degree from the University of Milano-Bicocca, Italy, and a Diploma in International Cooperation and Development from the Italian Institute for International Political Studies in Milan, Italy. Ms. Citroni confirmed that, if she were to be appointed to the mandate, she would relinquish any activity, consultancy and advisory positions, should a conflict of interest arise. The Consultative Group noted her knowledge, expertise and experience relating to the mandate as well as her clear vision for its further development and a cooperative approach with a variety of stakeholders.

22. **René Provost** is Full Professor at the Faculty of Law of McGill University, Canada, where he teaches international law, international humanitarian law and human rights. He is a Senior Counsel of the Québec Bar and a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and of the Pierre Elliot Trudeau Foundation. From 2005 to 2010, he was the founding Director of the McGill Centre for Human Rights and Legal Pluralism. He has been visiting professor at various universities. He has acted as amicus curiae in individual and inter-state cases before the European and Inter-American Courts of Human Rights, as well as before the Extraordinary Chamber of the Courts of Cambodia. He worked with civil society organizations including Human Rights Watch, the Lawyers' Committee for Human Rights and the Canadian Human Rights Foundation. He authored several books and published extensively in international law journals. He holds a PhD in Law from the University of Oxford, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, a Master of Law from the University of California, Berkley, United States of America, and a Bachelor of Laws from the University of Montreal, Canada. The Consultative Group noted his academic and legal expertise at international, regional and national levels in the area of the mandate.

23. **Susan M. Akram** is Clinical Professor at and Director of the International Human Rights Clinic at the School of Law of Boston University, United States of America. She litigated refugee and immigration cases in courts of the United States of America. She submitted reports to treaty bodies and special procedures. She authored publications on international law, human rights, refugee and migration law, as well as on missing and disappeared migrants. She holds a Juris Doctor from Georgetown University, Washington, United States of America, a Masters in International Human Rights from the University of Oxford, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, a Bachelor degree in Political Science from the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, United States of America, and a Diploma in International Human Rights from the Institut International des Droits de l'Homme, Strasbourg, France. The Consultative Group noted her academic expertise in the area of the mandate and experience in relation to missing and disappeared migrants in Central America.

Annex I - List of eligible candidates by mandate⁷

Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences

First name	Last name	Nationality	Gender
Reem	ALSALEM	Jordan	F
Victoria	ARENERE	Spain	F
Rina	ARSENEAULT	Canada	F
Nandini	AZAD	India	F
Rhizlaine	BENACHIR	Morocco	F
Caroline	BETTINGER-LÓPEZ	United States of America	F
Amanda	DALE	Canada	F
Samir Kumar	DAS	India	M
Rangita	DE SILVA DE ALWIS	Sri Lanka	F
Antonietta	ELIA	Italy	F
Mary	ELLSBERG	United States of America	F
Ruth	HALPERIN-KADDARI	Israel	F
Yasmeen	HASSAN	Pakistan	F
Nahid	HOSNI	Morocco	F
Rabiya	JAVERI AGHA	Pakistan	F
Anohar	JOHN	India	M
Jackie	JONES	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	F
Rhoda	KARIBI-WHYTE	Nigeria	F
Vannie	KOUAMOU DJOUNGUEP	Cameroon	F
Haina	LU	China	F
Enock	MALIVILI	Malawi	M
Njoki Susan	NDUNGU	Kenya	F
Melanie	O'BRIEN	Australia	F
Krishendaye	RAMPERSAD	Trinidad and Tobago	F
Sima	SAMAR	Afghanistan	F
Susana	SANZ CABALLERO	Spain	F
Shalva	WEIL	Israel	F

⁷ The list of candidates is provided in alphabetical order.

Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, member from Western European and other States

First name	Last name	Nationality	Gender
Susan M.	AKRAM	United States of America	F
Elisenda	CALVET MARTÍNEZ	Spain	F
Gabriella	CITRONI	Italy	F
José Ricardo	DE PRADA SOLAESA	Spain	M
Joanna	EVANS	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	F
Philip	LEACH	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	M
Lucie	MBALANGA MANGULIA	Belgium	F
René	PROVOST	Canada	M
Steven	RATNER	United States of America	M
Tanya Jane	SMITH	United States of America	F
Ralph	WILDE	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	M
Oliver	WINDRIDGE	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	M

*Annex II – List of shortlisted candidates interviewed by the Consultative Group*⁸

Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences

First name	Last name	Nationality	Gender
Reem	ALSALEM	Jordan	F
Nandini	AZAD	India	F
Rhizlaine	BENACHIR	Morocco	F
Amanda	DALE	Canada	F
Rangita	DE SILVA DE ALWIS	Sri Lanka	F
Rabiya	JAVERI AGHA	Pakistan	F
Haina	LU	China	F
Sima	SAMAR	Afghanistan	F

Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, member from Western European and other States

First name	Last name	Nationality	Gender
Susan M.	AKRAM	United States of America	F
Elisenda	CALVET MARTÍNEZ	Spain	F
Gabriella	CITRONI	Italy	F
René	PROVOST	Canada	M

⁸ The list of candidates is provided in alphabetical order.