



**TRANSPARENCY  
INTERNATIONAL**

the global coalition against corruption

**Transparency International's Inputs to Human  
Rights Council resolution 52/8 on promoting  
human rights and the Sustainable Development  
Goals through transparent, accountable and  
efficient public service delivery**

## Executive Summary

Transparency International is pleased to respond to the [call for inputs](#) kindly issued by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) regarding the Human Rights Council resolution 52/8 on promoting human rights and the Sustainable Development Goals through transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery.

Transparency International has been at the forefront of generating evidence and advocating to address the effects of corruption on public service delivery. To this end, in the past two decades, Transparency International has worked extensively through several multi-year, multi-country projects specifically addressing corruption in service delivery in the education, health and water sectors. One of the most recent iterations of this focus is the Inclusive Service Delivery in Africa (ISDA) project- an ongoing four-year regional project in five countries in Africa (Democratic Republic of Congo, Ghana, Madagascar, Rwanda, and Zimbabwe), aimed at improving access to education and healthcare services for women, girls and other groups at risk of discrimination. Preliminary research from the ISDA project indicates that:

- Key operational process in the health or education sectors are not immune to corruption risks.
- Such risks may have a higher likelihood to affect women, girls and other groups at risk of discrimination as well as stronger impacts, resulting in direct and indirect discrimination.
- There is a need to introduce greater enforcement of policies and legislation as well as innovative, community-led approaches to address the corruption loopholes.

Other efforts carried out by Transparency International to identify and prevent corruption risks in public service delivery, is the Land and Corruption in Africa II project - an ongoing four-year regional project in eight countries in Africa (Cameroon, Ghana, Kenya, Madagascar, South Africa, Uganda, Zambia, and Zimbabwe,) aimed at ensuring that corruption practices in land administration and land deals are addressed, contributing to improved livelihoods for men and women in Africa. Evidence showcases how land services (such as surveying and mapping, valuation and compensation, registration, dispute resolution) and land investments have been consistently identified as two areas that are highly vulnerable to corruption:

- The land sector exhibits one of the highest bribery rates among public services, affecting one in five people globally;
- Corruption in land administration can include political corruption, bribery, sexual extortion, fraud, and patronage;

- Overlapping mandates, high levels of discretion, unclear processes and fees, and slow and inefficient regulations present opportunities for corruption to speed up or circumvent processes to secure land, negotiate prices, or value land;
- Corruption fuels land grabbing in a variety of ways. It may involve large-scale land-based investments or involve smaller plots of land and local actors;
- In land deals, corruption is often used to overcome obstacles to acquiring the land, including community consent processes, environmental or social safeguards, or regulations related to how the land can be used. Similarly, land can be acquired through the irregular allocation of public or government-owned land to political cronies/allies in the private sector.

In response to the Call for Inputs, a TI Movement Survey on transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery was carried out, with responses from 18 TI chapters and partners representing many different regions. While local contexts accounted for a degree of variation in responses, some common findings include:

- **Challenges to public service delivery:** Main challenges identified to public service delivery are associated with a lack of transparency, accountability, and integrity in the governance and management of public resources towards the provision of key services. Corruption materializes in each stage of the cycle of public service delivery - from early stages of policy prioritization, budget allocation, procurement, and expenditure, to downstream stages of interaction between service providers and users. Among others these challenges include:
  - Undue influence in the allocation of resources that results in the de-prioritization of the sector and a low budgetary availability;
  - Corruption and petty bribery in the access to services and at the point of service delivery, including sextortion;
  - A lack of oversight and accountability mechanisms through the different stages of the public service delivery cycle (including early stages of policy making and budget allocation; as well as later stages of service provision and interaction with users);
  - Regional and urban-rural, as well as gender-based disparities;
  - Overlapping mandates, lack of coordination, high levels of discretion, unclear processes, and slow and inefficient regulations which present opportunities for corruption;
  - Weak institutions; and
  - Lack of public awareness of their rights and how to demand accountability.
- **Good practices and approaches:** some of the measures taken to overcome identified challenges to the provision of public services include:
  - Assessments of legal and regulatory loopholes that enable corruption in public service delivery;

- Increased demand for accountability, with the greater involvement of CSOs in the monitoring of policies, and budgets allocation;
  - The adoption of community-led approaches to monitor the provision of services (including citizen and community score-cards<sup>1</sup>);
  - Digitalisation in the provision of services, as well as in enabling higher transparency and access to information. This should include open, accessible and understandable information to all, including budgetary allocations, types and quantity of services delivered, etc.;
  - Access to transparent, accessible, independent, and safe dispute resolution mechanisms and whistleblowing channels;
  - Clear mandates and functions between relevant government institutions and agencies in charge of providing services;
  - Gender responsive approaches to participatory planning, budget allocations, management and oversight;
  - Integrity risk assessments in service provision; and
  - One-stop shops<sup>2</sup> for users of public services.
- **Non-take up estimates and barriers to accessing public services:** Estimates on the percentage of eligible individuals and households that do not claim and/or benefit from public services vary significantly depending on local context, ranging from less than 0.5% to more than 50%.

Barriers that hinder citizens from accessing public services to which they are entitled include, corruption and bribery, geographical inaccessibility, and discrimination and stigma. Non-take-up of services can be reduced by, inter alia, tackling impunity, removing financial barriers and designing measures reflecting cultural sensitivity and gender equity.

- **Challenges to public service delivery for vulnerable and marginalised groups:** Challenges of public services delivery to persons belonging to groups in situations of vulnerability and marginalization, include forms of communication, legislation and accountability frameworks failing to take account of marginalised groups, and the prevalence of sexual forms of corruption affecting especially women and girls. Good practices include specific social protection schemes, women empowerment initiatives, greater cultural and linguistic inclusivity, collecting disaggregated data, and providing trainings to public service providers on the needs of vulnerable and marginalized groups.

---

<sup>1</sup> Citizen report cards (CRCs) and Community Score Cards (CSCs) are designed to provide public entities with feedback from users on the quality and adequacy of public services. CRCs focus on ongoing monitoring and scoring, whereas the emphasis of CSCs is on immediate feedback from communities. More information on CRCs and CSCs is available [here](#).

<sup>2</sup> One-stop service centres were introduced in Rwanda for streamlined and improved access to services. More information can be found [here](#).

- **Digitalisation of public services:** Public services are digitalized in some countries but are not or only minimally so in others. Advantages include the greater transparency and accountability digitalization enables, and good practices include enabling citizen engagement and training before implementation. Challenges include the persistence of a digital divide as well as cybersecurity concerns.
- **Participation of private actors in public service delivery:** This is regulated and monitored in most countries through a combination of legal frameworks, oversight mechanisms, and regulatory bodies. Challenges include corruption, favouritism, financial barriers, lack of access to marginalized groups and quality concerns. Good practices include social accountability Initiatives and the use and strengthening of independent regulators.
- **Economic policies, legislation, promising practices, or strategies and national, regional, or local processes:** These exist to address many of the concerns raised above. They range from greater use of regional budgets to increase social spending, affirmative action programmes to frameworks and policies to promote equal access to public services, public financial management reforms and tailored social intervention programs.

Transparency International has produced a rich body of literature on how corruption intersects with topics such as public service delivery and inclusion. This includes, but is not limited to:

- Transparency International. 2017. [Corruption In Service Delivery: Topic Guide.](#)
- Transparency International, Equal Rights Trust. 2021. [Defying Exclusion.](#)
- Further evidence on the effects of corruption on the access and delivery of public services will be published at the beginning of 2024 and shared by Transparency International.
- Transparency International, 2018. [Land Corruption Topic Guide](#)

## Contents

Introduction.....	7
Inclusive Service Delivery Africa (ISDA) Project.....	7
TI Movement Survey on transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery: .....	9
What are the main challenges identified in your country/region in relation to public service delivery? Please address both institutional and practical barriers in your response. ....	10
What are the examples of good practices and approaches taken to overcoming identified challenges to the provision of public services? .....	20
To what extent does corruption play a role in excluding individuals and households from accessing public services? .....	28
How does corruption affect the delivery of public services to population groups in your country? .....	34
What percentage of eligible individuals and households do not claim and/or benefit from public services in your country (non-take up) .....	42
What are the barriers that hinder them from accessing public services to which they are entitled? How can non-take-up be reduced?.....	44
Please refer to challenges and good practices of public services delivery to persons belonging to groups in situations of vulnerability and marginalization .....	52
Are public services digitalized in your country? Please provide details including challenges and good practices in digitalization of public services that ensures transparency, accountability.....	58
How is the participation of private actors in public service delivery regulated and monitored in your country/region? Please share challenges and good practices.....	65
Describe economic policies, legislation, promising practices, or strategies and national, regional or local processes aimed at:.....	70
Other comments or inputs not covered above.....	76
Transparency International’s Body of Literature on Inclusive Public Service Delivery .....	78

## Introduction

Transparency International (TI) is a global movement with one vision: a world in which government, business, civil society and the daily lives of people are free of corruption. Through more than 100 chapters worldwide and an international secretariat in Berlin, TI leads the fight against corruption to turn this vision into reality.

For several years now, Transparency International has been at the forefront of generating evidence and engaging in advocacy to address the effects of corruption on public service delivery and how it impedes access to women, girls and groups at risk of discrimination. As reflected under Strategic Objective 1 of our [Global Strategy 2021-30](#) to “Protect the public's resources”, at TI we have a leading role to play in fighting corruption, increasing transparency, accountability and integrity in the management of resources to improve the access to critical public services (such as health, education, water and land administration).

Accordingly, Transparency International is pleased to respond to the [call for inputs](#) kindly issued by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) regarding the Human Rights Council resolution 52/8 on promoting human rights and the Sustainable Development Goals through transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery.

This response constitutes a joint submission by the TI Secretariat and TI chapter and partners. It comprises and is structured as follows:

- A description of TI's ongoing work to promote a higher inclusion in the delivery of public services;
- Responses from a TI Movement Survey on transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery (guided by OHCHR's call for inputs);
- An overview of TI's existing body of literature on this topic.

Transparency International (TI) is grateful to the OHCHR for this opportunity and is confident this submission will enhance the report to be presented to the Human Rights Council at its fifty-sixth session. Transparency International (TI) remains open and looks forward to more collaboration with the OHCHR on this important subject.

If there are any questions regarding this submission, please contact:

Daniela Patiño Piñeros, Programme Lead Public Resources, Transparency International Secretariat ([dpatignopignerros@transparency.org](mailto:dpatignopignerros@transparency.org)) & Jamie Bergin, Research Coordinator, Transparency International Secretariat ([jbergin@transparency.org](mailto:jbergin@transparency.org)).

## Transparency and Accountability towards an Inclusive Service Delivery

Transparency International is implementing the Inclusive Service Delivery in Africa (ISDA) Project- a four-year regional project in five countries in Africa (Democratic Republic of Congo, Ghana, Madagascar, Rwanda, and Zimbabwe), aimed at improving access to education and healthcare services for women, girls and other groups at risk of discrimination.

The project responds to a [core development challenge linked to the impact of corruption and impunity on access to education and healthcare services for groups at risk of discrimination, particularly women and girls in Africa](#). Corruption undermines the quality and quantity of public services, fuels inequalities in access to basic services and reduces the resources available for women and groups at risk of discrimination who are more reliant on public services, resulting in heightened poverty for those most marginalised.

To address corruption-related barriers to gender equality in education and healthcare, the project is focusing on three dimensions of change:

1	A <b>performance change of public institutions</b> that have the capacities to ensure that education and healthcare services are provided free of corruption (supply side of services)
2	A <b>behavioural change among citizens, particularly women, girls and those at risk of discrimination</b> , to speak out and report corruption and demand accountable and transparent services
3	A <b>practice change among influential intermediaries and stakeholders</b> who engage in coalitions and partnerships to mainstream anti-corruption issues within the education and healthcare agenda and create a supportive environment to reduce corruption related barriers to gender equality in the education and health sector.

In the ISDA current phase, the five TI chapters are carrying out corruption risk assessments (CRAs) of their respective health and education sectors. These CRAs set out to identify in greater detail the corruption risks occurring at different stages of key operational processes in these sectors and corresponding strategies to mitigate against these risks. While these studies are in the process of being finalised, major preliminary results as of October 2023 include:

- No key operational process in the health or education sectors is immune from corruption risks. While corruption risks are well known to exist in processes such as procurement, recruitment and admission to health and education services, they also exist in processes such as payroll management, inspection procedures, management of property, and many more. Accordingly, while many countries have policies in place to mitigate certain corruption risks, others receive much less attention.
- Nevertheless, policies and legislation often suffer from a lack of enforcement. Equally, there is often a lack of awareness of corruption risks within the health and education sectors and the available avenues to report it. There is a need for innovative and community-led approaches to address the loopholes allowing corruption to occur.
- Many corruption risks have a higher likelihood of occurring against women, girls and group at risk of discrimination; this is especially true for the offence of sextortion which occurs across many levels of health and education services. These risks also often have a higher impact on these groups and lead to an effective denial of services.



- Corruption risks in these sectors then, can cause direct forms of discrimination (for example, a school official demanding a bribe to admit a person with disabilities as a student) but also indirect forms of discrimination (for example, the strain on resources caused by corruption can lead to families prioritising the education of their male children over their female children).

In the next phase of the ISDA project, chapters will undertake studies on the interlinkages between corruption and discrimination and will document real-life experiences in this regard, including the role of intersectionality.

For further information about the ISDA project, please contact:

Dahmata Koffi, Project Manager, Transparency International Secretariat ([dkoffi@transparency.org](mailto:dkoffi@transparency.org)) & Jamie Bergin, Research Coordinator, Transparency International Secretariat ([jbergin@transparency.org](mailto:jbergin@transparency.org)).

## TI Movement Survey on transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery

The TI movement comprises more than 100 chapters worldwide, many of which are among the leading anti-corruption voices in their respective countries. To take advantage of the rich collective knowledge repository the Movement offers, a survey was shared across TI Chapters and partners asking them to share any knowledge, research or projects they had on transparent, accountable and efficient public service delivery in their respective countries or area of work. The survey questions were all drawn from the OHCHR's Call for Inputs. Each question was optional to answer. The survey was shared in English, French and Spanish.

The following TI chapters and partners responded to the survey:

- ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi
- Transparency International Defence & Security
- Kuwait Transparency Society
- Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL)
- Transparency International Bangladesh
- Transparency International Rwanda
- Bahrain Transparency Society
- Transparency International Pakistan
- Rasheed (TI - Jordan)
- Transparency Maroc
- Transparency International Cambodia
- Ghana Integrity Initiative
- Transparency International Kenya
- TI España
- Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH) – Republic of Congo
- Transparency International - Initiative Madagascar (TI-MG)
- Transparency International Cameroon
- Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption- (LICOCO RDC)

The following sections share their responses in full:

## What are the main challenges identified in your country/region in relation to public service delivery? Please address both institutional and practical barriers in your response.

The main challenges, institutional and practical barriers identified by the respondents in relation to public service delivery are:

### Institutional barriers

#### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *Quality of government services, bureaucracy, corruption With the help of those interested in improving quality, we were able to force the government to amend the Public Tenders Law and approve the Right to Info Law and the Conflict of Interest Law. However, we believe that government mismanagement is still a major obstacle and we need to change the management mentality to more good governance and transparency." Quality of government services, democratic reform and integrity of elections.*

#### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi:**

- *The protection law for whistleblowers has not yet been adopted in Burundi, which means that citizens are afraid to denounce cases of corruption.*

#### **Transparency International Defence & Security:**

- *We are a Global Thematic Network working on corruption in the defence and security sector. Defence sector corruption consumes resources that could otherwise be used for the provision of public services that directly benefit the quality of life in the country, such as health and education. Defence is expensive: This offers incentives for corrupt actors to divert large amounts of public money, which results in the waste of large amounts of public resources. As with corruption in other sectors, money lost to corruption in the defence sector inhibits a country's development and deepens social inequalities. It hampers the achievement of all SDGs, and especially SDG 16 as the Goal on peace, justice and strong institutions. Secondly, the provision of state and human security is a public service in itself, as it is a service funded by public money, provided by governments, with the intention to benefit all citizens. Corruption hence prohibits defence and security forces from performing the public service they are mandated to do. When occurring in military operations, it can also directly contribute to further destabilisation of the region by inadvertently strengthening prevalent corrupt networks. This is due to military operations often taking place in environments characterised by high systemic corruption.*
- *Corruption in defence and security has a far-reaching negative impact on human security as well as on sustainable development as a whole. It renders defence and security institutions ineffective, which in turn undermines the provision of security, promotion of rule of law, and protection of human rights. The grievances that it creates erode public trust, fuel instability and in some cases drive recruitment into violent extremist groups – the list goes on. It distorts political incentives away from decision-making in the public interest towards decision-making in private interests, and wastes money that could otherwise have been spent on public services and other public goods.*

- *In all cases, corruption presents a threat to peace and security that, if not prevented, deters countries and regions in making progress on the SDGs. The destabilisation it can cause can destroy civilian infrastructure needed for the achievement of SDGs 3 and 4, causes environmental damage and food insecurity. Most prominently though, it undermines the achievement of SDG 16 with its target of reducing corruption, ensuring peace and stability, and strengthening institutions.*

#### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Some of the main challenges around public service delivery in Liberia are low funding, corruption, poor oversight, and weak institutions.*

#### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *Low budgetary allocation in key sectors of public service delivery like health and education; infrastructural and human resource deficits; Corruption including bribery, unauthorised payment and extortion, nepotism, negligence of duty, bureaucratic delay, misbehaviour, and related types of harassment, influence peddling, fraudulence, embezzlement and other irregularities. Low public awareness is also taken advantage of. Lack of enforcement of laws, rules and regulations that lead to impunity of law-breakers. Corruption and irregularities treated as a way of life.*

#### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *The Government of Rwanda is committed to promoting accountable governance to the delivery of development and improved service at the decentralized levels. This is well highlighted in the National Strategy for Transformation (NST1) that intends to guide Rwanda's development interventions over the next seven years (2018-2024) whereby setting priorities is meant to strengthen the capacity, service delivery, and accountability of public institutions as well as increase citizens' participation, engagement, and partnerships in development. The new orientation of the Government of Rwanda is to shift Decentralization from Governance to imperatives of socio-economic transformation and sustainable development. Another important rationale is that since 2012, a number of policy and legal frameworks have changed yet decentralization has a bearing on their implementation. Hence, the review of the 2012 National Decentralization Policy is justified to align with these changes focusing on new development priorities. Over the past two decades, there have been impressive achievements from the implementation of the previous decentralization policies with implications for the overall context of governance in Rwanda. The main objective of the policy was to ensure the political, economic, social, managerial, administrative, and technical empowerment of local populations to fight against poverty by participating in the planning, monitoring, and management of their development process. The Policy was subsequently revised in 2012 to keep its focus and align with the changing political priorities and socio-economic aspirations. Challenges and gaps remain, especially in rural areas where some public services are not available, and some of these services do not reach the intended citizens especially hard infrastructure (roads, transportation, health facilities). Digital technology and user-centric approaches to public service delivery still need to be improved and adapted to the local context, The shortage of digital skills and devices is still notable among some local residents despite the*

*growing demand for electronic services. Local officials need to ensure that services are adapted in context and consideration to vulnerable groups, including people with disabilities.*

### **Bahrain Transparency Society:**

- *Elections: Bahrain prevented tens of thousands of citizens from running for elections due to its issuance of an amendment to the election law in 2018. This amendment came due to the popular demands that occurred in the year 2011, which demanded more democracy, freedom of opinion and expression, and human rights. This prevention of tens of thousands of citizens from exercising their political rights contradicts with the goals of sustainable development related to greater freedom of opinion, expression, and democracy. Due to the amendment to the election law, Bahrain also prevented tens of thousands of citizens from participating in various civil society organizations (political, cooperative, charitable, professional, and human rights organizations) which negatively affected the performance of civil society institutions.*
- *Civil Society Organizations: The Ministry of Social Development, which is responsible for civil society organizations, followed further restrictions on civil society organizations, prohibiting these organizations from obtaining any type of internal or external funding without their approval. Approvals are not granted to associations in general and especially to independent associations such as human rights associations and those working in the field of women and youth. This restriction had an effective role in the reluctance of young people, women and those with qualifications to join volunteer work in civil society organizations.*
- *Public Debt: The volume of public debt in Bahrain reached 45 billion US dollars, which represents 130% of the gross domestic product, and the annual interest on public debt reached more than 2 billion dollars, which reduce dramatically the progress in implementing the sustainable development goals, as the rise in public debt reflects the decline in health services, education, municipality and other services.*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In Pakistan, the delivery of public services is fraught with a range of challenges, encompassing both institutional and practical barriers. Transparency International Pakistan has identified these issues, shedding light on the complexities and obstacles that impede effective public service delivery. Institutional Barriers:*

- *Corruption and Bribery: Corruption remains a pervasive problem in Pakistan, affecting public service delivery across various sectors. Bureaucratic corruption, bribery, and kickbacks hinder the efficient provision of services, as resources are often siphoned off through corrupt practices. In Corruption Perceptions Index 2022, Pakistan's ranking was 140 out of 180 and it consistently remains on the bottom in the index.*
- *Lack of Accountability: Accountability mechanisms within government institutions are often weak and ineffective. Public officials may engage in corrupt practices with impunity, and there is a lack of transparent processes to hold them accountable. According to National Corruption Perception Survey 2022 (NCPS) conducted by Transparency International (TI) Pakistan, at the national level, 45% of the survey-takers considered the role of anti-graft institutions as "ineffective" in curbing corruption in the country. Inefficient Bureaucracy: The bureaucratic machinery in Pakistan is often criticized for its inefficiency and red tape. Cumbersome administrative procedures can lead to delays and inefficiencies in delivering services, frustrating both service providers and recipients.*

- *Political Interference: Political influence and nepotism can distort the allocation of resources and affect the equitable distribution of public services. Those with political connections may receive preferential treatment, while others are left underserved. According to NCPS 2022 conducted by Transparency International (TI) Pakistan 26.5% of survey-takers think that Governments use state institutions for their personal gain.*
- *Legal Framework and Regulatory Challenges: A lack of clear and comprehensive legal frameworks and regulations can create challenges in public service delivery. Ambiguities in laws and regulations can be exploited, leading to inconsistent service provision. According to National Corruption Perception Survey 2022 (NCPS) conducted by Transparency International (TI) Pakistan, the police and Judiciary are perceived to be the most corrupt sectors at the national level as 25% and 20% survey-taker showed their dissatisfaction on these institutions, respectively.*

### **TI - Jordan:**

*Jordan, like many countries, faces various challenges in public service delivery. These challenges can be broadly categorized into institutional and practical barriers. Here are some of the main challenges:*

- *Bureaucratic Inefficiency: Jordan's public sector can be characterized by bureaucratic red tape, which often leads to delays in service delivery. Complex procedures and excessive paperwork can hinder the efficiency of public services.*
- *Lack of Accountability: A lack of clear accountability mechanisms can lead to issues of corruption and mismanagement within the public sector. This can erode public trust in government institutions.*
- *Limited Financial Resources: Jordan faces budgetary constraints, and this can affect the quality and accessibility of public services. Limited funding can lead to inadequate infrastructure and human resources.*
- *Political Interference: Political interference in the public service can undermine the impartiality and professionalism of civil servants, affecting the quality of service delivery.*
- *Fragmentation and Overlapping Functions: Overlapping functions and responsibilities between various government agencies can lead to confusion and inefficiency in public service delivery. Streamlining and coordination are often lacking.*

### **Transparency Maroc:**

*Justice : One of the most corrupted sectors*

### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

*There are several challenges in Cambodia in relation to public service delivery, both institutional and practical. Some of the main challenges are:*

- *Corruption: Corruption is a significant challenge in Cambodia, and it affects public service delivery. Institutional corruption in government agencies leads to the diversion of resources away from essential services, and practical corruption results in citizens having to pay bribes to access basic services, including healthcare, education, social justice and administrative services.*
- *Lack of coordination: In Cambodia, there is often a lack of coordination between government agencies responsible for providing public services. This lack of coordination results in duplication of effort and resources, leading to inefficiencies in service delivery.*
- *Limited access to information: Access to information is a significant institutional barrier to effective public service delivery. Lack of reliable and accurate information limits the ability of*

*the government to plan and implement public services effectively, leading to poor coordination and service delivery.*

#### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Corruption continues to be a pressing concern, exerting adverse effects on the quality and accessibility of services. Such effects encompass practices like bribery, embezzlement, and various other corrupt activities that erode confidence in public institutions. This fact is substantiated by the repeated violations documented in the Auditor General's comprehensive reports to Parliament.*
- *Within the public sector, bureaucracy can often manifest as sluggish and unwieldy, resulting in service delivery delays. Prolonged administrative procedures and excessive red tape can cause frustration for both those delivering services and those receiving them.*
- *The public sector often faces budgetary constraints, leading to inadequate funding for critical services like healthcare and education. This limitation can result in substandard service quality.*
- *The politicization of public services can disrupt their delivery. When appointments and promotions are based on political affiliations rather than merit, it can lead to inefficiency and a lack of accountability.*

#### **TI España:**

- *Institutional design for the distribution of autonomies and functions in which activities overlap, lacking coordination between the autonomous communities and the centralised administration.*

#### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH)**

*The Republic of Congo faces many challenges in the delivery of public services:*

- *Poor governance and financial mismanagement; <https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2020/01/29/caisse-siphonnee-ou-est-passe-largent-du-petrole-congolais/>*
- *Poor quality health services and inadequate health infrastructure are key challenges that Congo is facing.*
- *Public services in Congo are plagued by a set of anti-values. These anti-values considerably affect the quality of public service and reduce not only user satisfaction, but even more so access to the rights of populations, as well as marginalized communities and communities living near industrial projects. (<https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2022/04/08/etude-socio-economique-sur-les-communautes-locales-et-populations-autochtones-de-la-lekoumou/>)*
- *Corruption in the public service is endemic and systemic. (<https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2023/05/13/riposte-contre-la-covid-19-des-milliards-envoles/#:~:text=13%20MAI%202023-.RIPOSTE%20CONTRE%20LA%20COVID%2D19%20%3A%20DES%20MILLIARDS%20ENVOL%C3%89S,-R%C3%A9alis%C3%A9%20dans%20l> e).*
- *Impunity, lack of sanctions, and lack of accountability of public officials are aggravating factors that perpetuate corruption and poor governance, given an equally corrupt, lax and executive-dominated judicial system.*
- *The weakness of redress mechanisms limits the participation of communities in the monitoring of public governance and the recurrent denunciations of citizens remain ineffective. In sectors*



*such as health, education, justice or the police, to name but a few, complaints from the public are important in view of the poor services provided, but the system does not evolve or change. If the authorities admit these shortcomings, sanctions do not follow.*

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

*In Madagascar, public service delivery faces many challenges, both institutional and practical, that hinder the efficient and equitable delivery of essential services to the population. Specifically regarding the health sector, here are the institutional challenges and barriers identified by TI-MG during studies and investigations:*

- *Payment extortion: Health workers or health facilities may sometimes demand additional payments from patients for services that should be free. This creates a financial barrier to accessing health care, especially for vulnerable populations.*
- *Embezzlement: Funds allocated to health facilities can be misappropriated or mismanaged, limiting their ability to provide quality medicines, medical equipment, and services.*
- *Nepotism and favoritism: The appointment of medical staff and managers of health facilities can sometimes be based on political or political considerations rather than on qualifications and skills, which is detrimental to the quality of services.*
- *Lack of transparency and lack of access to essential information: Opacity in the management of resources allocated to public health can make it difficult to monitor public funds and assess the quality of services.*
- *Low remuneration of health staff: The low salaries of health professionals may prompt some to accept bribes or engage in corrupt practices to compensate for their insufficient income.*
- *Unequal access to care: Corruption can create inequalities in access to health care, as individuals with financial resources or political connections have an advantage in obtaining higher quality services.*
- *Culture of impunity: The lack of effective prosecution of corruption in the health sector can encourage the persistence of these practices.*

### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- *The biggest challenges identified in our country are widespread corruption and impunity for those who engage in corrupt practices.*

## **Practical Barriers**

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

- *Lack of Resources: Resource constraints, both financial and human, can hamper public service delivery. Inadequate funding for critical sectors like healthcare and education can result in subpar service quality.*  
*Inadequate Infrastructure: In some areas, a lack of infrastructure and facilities, particularly in rural and remote regions, makes it challenging to provide essential services. This lack of infrastructure hinders access to healthcare, education, and clean water.*
- *Capacity and Training: Insufficient training and capacity-building for public service providers can impact the quality of services. Ensuring that service providers are adequately trained and equipped is essential for effective delivery.*

- *Transparency and Data Management: Transparent record-keeping and data management systems are often lacking, leading to difficulties in monitoring and evaluating public service delivery. This lack of transparency makes it harder to identify areas in need of improvement.*
- *Access and Inclusivity: Unequal access to public services remains a significant practical barrier. Rural populations, women, and minority communities often face greater obstacles in accessing services, exacerbating social and economic disparities. According to a United Nations report, 98.8 per cent of women in the poorest rural households are deprived of education, while only less than 3% of the 17–23 age group of girls have access to higher education.*

#### **TI - Jordan:**

- *Resource Constraints: The country faces limitations in terms of financial and human resources, which can affect the government's ability to provide essential services effectively.*
- *Infrastructure Deficiencies: In some areas, inadequate infrastructure, such as roads, water supply, and sanitation facilities, can hinder the delivery of basic services.*
- *Regional Disparities: There are significant disparities in service provision between urban and rural areas. Rural regions may face challenges related to access to healthcare, education, and other critical services.*
- *Education Quality: While there is access to education, the quality of education remains a concern. This can affect the long-term prospects of Jordan's population.*
- *Healthcare Access: Healthcare services may not be equally accessible to all citizens, particularly those in rural or remote areas. Overcrowding and resource shortages in public healthcare facilities are common issues.*
- *Water Scarcity: Jordan is one of the most water-scarce countries in the world, and the efficient management of water resources is crucial. Water supply and sanitation services may be affected by this scarcity.*
- *Refugee Crisis: The presence of a large number of refugees, especially from neighboring countries, places additional strain on public services, such as healthcare, education, and housing.*
- *Digital Divide: Not all citizens have equal access to digital technology and the internet. This can limit access to e-government services and information.*

*Addressing these challenges requires a concerted effort from the government, civil society, and international partners. Initiatives to streamline bureaucracy, improve accountability, allocate resources efficiently, and reduce political interference are crucial. Additionally, investments in infrastructure, education, healthcare, and water management are needed to enhance public service delivery and reduce regional disparities. Efforts to bridge the digital divide and better manage the impact of the refugee crisis also play a significant role in improving public services in Jordan.*

#### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *Health: Covid 19 has shown that healthcare is a failing sector.*
- *Education: access to education is undermined by corruption.*

#### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

*There are several challenges in Cambodia in relation to public service delivery, both institutional and practical. Some of the main challenges are:*



- *Limited finance support: Limited finance support is a practical barrier to effective public service delivery in Cambodia. The government often has insufficient resources to invest in essential equipment and personnel for public service delivery, despite the importance of these resources for service delivery.*
- *Lack of human resources: Another practical barrier to public service delivery is insufficient human resources. The government often has too few public servants to meet the growing demands for services, particularly in rural areas, resulting in long wait times and reduced access to services.*
- *Limited capacity: The lack of skilled and trained personnel limits the capacity of public institutions to provide quality services.*

*Addressing these challenges will require a multi-pronged approaches, involving the government, civil society, and the private sector, as well as investment in critical areas such as human resources and information systems.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Geographic Disparities: Rural areas often face greater challenges in accessing public services due to limited infrastructure and the concentration of services in urban centres.*
- *Inadequate facilities, poorly trained staff, and limited access to quality education and healthcare are practical barriers to public service delivery. This affects the overall well-being of citizens.*
- *Digital Divide: While digitalization is improving service delivery in many areas, the digital divide still exists, and not everyone has equal access to technology or the skills to use it effectively.*
- *Cultural and Linguistic Diversity: Ghana is culturally diverse, with multiple languages and traditions. Ensuring that public services are accessible and culturally sensitive to all citizens can be a practical challenge.*
- *Sustained enhancement of skills and competencies among public service personnel to ensure efficient and professional service delivery presents a persistent challenge.*
- *Public Awareness: Lack of awareness among citizens regarding their rights and the available public services can be a practical barrier to accessing these services.*

*The public service was created to provide basic service to citizens however, Research such as that conducted by the Institute of Economic Affairs (IEA) indicates that access to some basic services like good sanitation is a challenge to many Ghanaians which according to Matoso et al., 2016:3) is a cause of poor performance in achieving Sustainable Development Goals. Access to other basic services such as healthcare, safe water, and sanitation is lacking. Efficient public transportation is a challenge leading to unregulated private transport service. These challenges have persisted since independence and have impacted negatively to human growth and development of the country.*

*Recognizing the challenges of public services, successive governments have initiated various public sector reforms since the mid-80s and have achieved various degrees of success. Mention can be made of Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP), Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs), and Economic Management Capacity Building Project which resulted in the creation of the Ministry of the Public Sector Reforms which later turned into the Public Sector Reform Secretariat (PSRS)*

## **TI España:**

- *Equitable development of the digitalisation of the State administration in the different departments of the central administration, as well as in the regional administrations, which weakens access to services efficiently and quickly.*
- *Poor access to housing, whether owned or rented, leading to inequities of access and abuse.*
- *Inequality in the treatment of the migrant population, for example, with the granting of Golden Visas to non-resident foreigners who invest in the country.*
- *Rural depopulation and difficulties in the general access to basic services by the population.*

## **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH)**

*The Republic of Congo faces many challenges in the delivery of public services:*

- *Low quality of services offered;*
- *Limited data and information capacity;*
- *Demand for bribes in exchange for public services, - poor quality services,*
- *Failure to comply with prescribed waiting periods in the delivery of expected services, favouritism, racketeering, extortion, mismanagement of state funds and equipment (<https://www.finances.gouv.cg/sites/default/files/documents/Republique%20du%20Congo%20-%20Rapport%20Diagnostic%202018%20-.pdf>)*
- *The lack of training associated with the recruitment of civil servants on the basis of clientelism and nepotism reinforces this state of affairs. The process of appointing and recruiting public officials should be guided by transparent and reliable mechanisms, such as tenders and competitions, to promote competition, fairness, gender issues, etc. - The State makes commitments, signs agreements, adopts legislation, but institutionally, there is still a gap between the State's commitments and its practice or the practices of its agents in the field.*

## **Transparency International Madagascar:**

*From a practical point of view, we find:*

- *Low level of funding for the health sector: the lack of adequate financial resources is a major obstacle to the provision of quality public health care services. Limited budgets hamper the government's ability to invest more in these essential services*
- *corruption: Corruption is one of the scourges that plagues public health services. It exacerbates the abuse of power and office for private interest;*
- *Limited access to health care services in rural areas: Madagascar is a vast country with many landlocked rural areas. Low-lying infrastructure and public services struggle to reach these remote areas, leading to inequalities in access;*
- *Inadequate basic infrastructure: the lack of adequate infrastructure, such as electricity, drinking water and health facilities*
- *Shortage of medical personnel: Madagascar suffers from a shortage of health professionals, including doctors, nurses and paramedical staff. This leads to an overload of work for existing health workers and delays in the delivery of care. In addition, bureaucracy is also one of the factors contributing to the unequal distribution of these staff, despite the fact that a shortage has already been identified;*

- *Lack of medicines and equipment: Health facilities often lack medicines, basic medical equipment and supplies, which affects the quality of care;*
- *High cost for patients: as a corollary to the lack of medicines and equipment, patients, especially households, bear a large part of the costs related to care despite the existence of support programmes to reduce the financial burden of health care;*
- *low Raising awareness of the right to health and the fight against corruption.*

*In Madagascar, Law No. 2022-018 of 13 December 2022 on the general orientation of the education system stipulates in its article 15 that "the State shall advocate free and compulsory primary education" in the public sector of 08 August 2022. The education sector is among the least allocated sectors in terms of budget and many children do not have access to school, especially in remote and rural areas. Regarding the provision of services in the education sector, there are many challenges and the list is not exhaustive:*

- *Lack of school infrastructure in rural or remote areas: Public Primary Schools (PPE), high schools and universities are concentrated in the major cities of the regions of Madagascar. This is the reason why many do not have access to school because they will have to travel miles every day before they can get to school. And also, to make up for this lack of infrastructure, the private sector contributes in a significant way to the financing of national education, but unfortunately few citizens still have the means to send their children to these schools. New EPPs, High Schools and Universities have been built since 2021 but many construction contracts have been awarded to incompetent companies/individuals due to corruption (Transparency International – Initiative Madagascar carried out investigations on the construction of these EPPs in 2021 and confirmed the existence of favoritism in the awarding of these public contracts: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=P211c7EhED8> )*
- *Despite the fact that the education sector is among the sectors most allocated by the State budget (15% of the national budget allocated to this sector in 2021), the performance rate in terms of the primary completion rate is still deplorable. Also, most of this budget is allocated to the expenditures of the pay that corresponds to the program of administration and coordination of the sector. Other sectors such as pre-school, basic education, non-formal education and secondary education are thus under-allocated.*
- *Teachers call to vote for a candidate: In Madagascar, education personnel, given their number and weight, are an interesting target for politicians during elections, given that they constitute an important reservoir of votes. Teachers and administrative officials (especially at the level of SCOLar constituencies) have confided that they have been forced to participate in a candidate's election campaigns since last September. They are threatened with dismissal or assignment if they do not comply with this order. The administration is most often instrumentalized in the electoral campaign. Other public officials participate voluntarily in election campaigns and make no secret of their support for a candidate and a party. Indeed, "the system of recruitment or promotion within the administration is such that civil servants are affiliated with the ruling party".*
- *Obsolete course content: the quality of the education provided to students remains deplorable because no update of course content has been made from generation to generation while many stories have already happened.*
- *Slowness and administrative burdens: the usual negative image of the administration in Madagascar intuitively leads to the idea of an unfortunate person sent from office to office: everyone declaring himself incompetent and asking him to go elsewhere or to come back later.*

*Without "giving a little" or without knowing someone, the processing of the file to obtain goods or services within the education sector drags on.*

- *Payment to obtain a fake diploma or Payment to be enrolled*

#### **Transparency International Kenya:**

- *Corruption – bribery.*
- *Poor access to public services - long distances to service points especially in rural areas; limited number of public service points e.g hospitals, schools, government offices.*

## **What are the examples of good practices and approaches taken to overcoming identified challenges to the provision of public services?**

### **Digitalization-Technology**

#### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *Issuing a unified application for smart phones for most government agencies, with the aim of providing services quickly and easily, and work is underway to demand the inclusion of all agencies. The experience has been good so far, but the obstacles are that some important agencies such as the municipality and the Commercial Licensing Department have not yet joined this application well. Digitizing services. The government recently launched an electronic platform for many public services, but this platform does not include social services and assistance.*

#### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *Partial digitalization;*

#### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *E-Government Initiatives: Leveraging technology and innovation, Rwanda's home-grown e-government initiatives improve efficiency, transparency, and accessibility of public services, facilitating citizen interaction with the government.*
- *One Laptop Per Child: A key project that aims at the Enhancement of Education through the Introduction of technology in Primary Schools. The project, through digital, interactive, animated graphic rich content is able to help students visualize, simulate, share various complex concepts which improves their understanding, retention and ability to innovate. Rwanda's home-grown solutions and policies exemplify a unique and contextually relevant approach, emphasizing community engagement, inclusivity, and innovative strategies. These initiatives underline the nation's determination to address historical challenges, promote social cohesion, and drive sustainable development for the benefit of its citizens.*

#### **TI – Jordan:**

*Jordan has made efforts to overcome the challenges in public service delivery through various good practices and approaches. Here are some examples:*

- *E-Government Initiatives: Jordan has been investing in e-government initiatives to streamline and digitize public service delivery. Services like e-payment systems, online forms, and information portals have made it easier for citizens to access services and reduced the bureaucratic burden.*

#### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Digital Transformation: The Ghanaian government has been actively digitizing public services. Initiatives such as the National Digital Property Address System, e-government platforms, and mobile applications have improved access to services, reduced bureaucracy, and increased transparency.*

#### **TI España:**

*Some of the initiatives that could be highlighted are:*

- *Digital Spain Agenda 2026: The country's digital transformation strategy that proposes, among other things, that by 2025 50% of public services will be available through a mobile app*

#### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

*Among the many examples of good practices identified in the Republic of Congo to address the deficit in the provision of public services, we can mention:*

- *The program to digitize public services launched by the Congolese government in 2021. The overall objective of the project is to accelerate digital transformation in Congo as a source of jobs and a vector for better governance, in particular by supporting the modernization of public administration information systems and the development of the digital economy in an efficient and inclusive manner throughout the country. <https://fr.africanews.com/2023/01/27/congo-la-banque-mondiale-finance-la-digitalisation-des-services-publics//>*

#### **Transparency International Kenya:**

- *Corruption reporting/whistleblowing mechanisms by CSOs like TI-Kenya and public complaints systems by the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission, Ombudsman/Commission on Administrative Justice.*
- *Digitisation-Use of ICT systems to avail some services 'Huduma' public service centers that provide one service point for various government services such as the revenue authority, lands services, civil registration etc*

### **Accountability- Management of service provision**

#### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *Ubudehe Categorization: Ubudehe, a socio-economic categorization system, assists in identifying vulnerable households, enabling targeted and efficient delivery of social services, support, and interventions to vulnerable citizens.*
- *Imihigo (Performance Contracts): A performance contract system that enhances public service delivery by setting performance targets for government officials, promoting accountability and efficient use of resources to achieve desired outcomes.*

- *12 Year Basic Education Program: Rwanda's commitment to providing free and compulsory 12-year basic education is a home-grown policy addressing the need for accessible and quality education, enhancing human capital development.*
- *School feeding programme: To promote enrolment, attendance, retention and learning.*

### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

*There have been some outstanding practices and approaches taken to addressing these issues:*

- *Decentralization and De-concentration Reforms: These reforms have allowed for greater decision-making power and resources to be distributed to local authorities, resulting in improved service delivery at the sub-national level.*
- *Capacity Building: The comprehensive capacity-building programs for public sector staff have improved technical competencies and provided them with the necessary management, good governance, Gender Responsive Public Services (GRPS) and leadership skills to meet the challenges of public service delivery.*
- *Good Governance: In order to enhance transparency, accountability, law enforcement, and to prevent corruption, high-level commitment with comprehensive policy frameworks have been initiated to promote a culture of ethical behaviour and good governance.*

*Cambodia has still faced a number of challenges in public service delivery with both institutional and practical barriers. However, by implementing good practices and approaches to enhance transparency, accountability, and improve governance, Cambodia will be able to provide better public service delivery to citizens.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Free Senior High School (SHS) Policy: The government's Free SHS policy has improved access to quality education by eliminating the cost of tuition and other fees at the secondary school level. This addresses the practical barrier of the cost of education.*
- *National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS): The NHIS provides health insurance to Ghanaians, enhancing healthcare accessibility and reducing the financial burden on citizens. This approach mitigates the practical barrier of inadequate healthcare access.*
- *Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs): Collaborations with private sector entities in infrastructure development have helped bridge the infrastructure gap. Examples include the expansion of the Tema Port and Kotoka International Airport, which have improved trade and travel.*
- *Decentralization and Local Governance: Decentralization reforms empower local governments and communities to make decisions about local services. This approach ensures that services are tailored to local needs and preferences.*
- *Capacity Building: Continuous training and development programs for public service personnel, such as the Civil Service Training Centre, improve skills and competencies, enhancing service efficiency.*

*In the past decades Ghana has made efforts to transform the public sector to enable it to improve on service delivery. However, these reforms have not improved the services of the public sector but have attained some level of achievement. In 2010, the government of Ghana came up with a new approach to public sector reforms. Government and policymakers blamed failure of various attempt of reforms on poor institutional capacity, inadequate support from central agencies, and poor coordination between sectors. The new reforms focused on delivering public service; "delivery model" this new approach is more of problem-solving approach which tasked various units under the municipals and district assemblies to device performance improvement strategy that will improve service delivery. Some*



recent major reforms in the public sector are “Ghana Decentralization Policy Review (GDPR) in 2004, Economic Management Capacity Building Project – Public Sector Reform Program from 2005-2011 and Ghana's New Approach to Public Sector Reform Focusing on Delivery in November, 2010” world bank/government of Ghana report cited in (Ghana's New Approach to Public Sector Reform Focusing on Delivery, November 2010)

### **TI España:**

- *In relation to the first two challenges identified, it could be pointed out the promotion of coordination between state agents, through agencies dedicated to it, as well as the development of digital and open access platforms for public administrations.*
- *In relation to the inequality in the treatment of the migrant population, which is expressed at different levels and could be expressed through the granting of Golden Visas (which, in addition to the challenge they pose for access to public services, generate perverse incentives for money laundering), TI Spain promotes the elimination of this regime. and/or in any case, it is advocated that there is a detailed regulation that guarantees material equality between foreigners who seek to access residency through other mechanisms. Likewise, the existence of control over the origin of the funds that are going to be invested in the country is a guarantee that they do not come from illegal activities in third countries.*

*Some of the initiatives that could be highlighted are:*

- *IV Open Government Plan: 10 commitments made by public administrations to strengthen transparency and accountability, as well as to train citizens in the control of a culture of integrity.*
- *Law No. 2/2023, regulating the protection of persons who report regulatory and anti-corruption violations.*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *In 2020, the city of Pointe Noire set up a geographic information system (GIS), a system that is supposed to improve urban land management, local development planning and natural hazard prevention. Thanks to this program, the city can: • Streamline the procedures for allocating plots and issuing land titles, thus reducing delays, costs and, above all, fraud; • Optimising urban planning and the management of public facilities, taking into account the current and future needs of residents; • Strengthening resilience to climate hazards, by mapping risk areas and developing emergency plans. [https://wri-sites.s3.amazonaws.com/forest-atlas.org/assets/forest-atlas.org/cog/resources/amenagementterritoire/Agriculture/Monographie\\_Pointe-Noire\\_final\\_SOFRECO-CERAPE.pdf](https://wri-sites.s3.amazonaws.com/forest-atlas.org/assets/forest-atlas.org/cog/resources/amenagementterritoire/Agriculture/Monographie_Pointe-Noire_final_SOFRECO-CERAPE.pdf)*

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *Teachers call for a vote for a candidate: resignation of existing teachers who are convinced by the candidate's programme.*
- *Improve the remuneration and working conditions of health personnel to reduce incentives for corruption.*
- *Strengthen internal and external controls to ensure that resources allocated to health are used appropriately.*

- *Support training and raising awareness among health personnel on the importance of professional integrity and ethics.*
- *Lack of school infrastructure in rural or remote areas: as the State budget is not sufficient for the renovation and/or construction of a school, the call for project funding remains a solution to bridge this gap between urban and rural.*
- *Course content is obsolete: many civil society organisations have proposals to update some subjects in primary education. Other people also volunteer to share various news with students through the broadcast of film reports, book sharing, etc.*

#### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- *So far, we can perhaps say, the free basic education, the initiative of the implementation of Universal Health Coverage*

### **Social Accountability- Civic monitoring**

#### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi:**

- *The approach used by the Legal Assistance and Citizen Action Centre (ALAC) has been appreciated by citizens and public institutions. We also involved all our partners to ensure the success of the activities. Women and young people have played a major role in the fight against corruption in health and education.*

#### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Some good practices in Liberia include increased csos monitoring; collaboration with state actors to educate citizens about public service delivery issues and their roles in addressing them; advocacy for more citizens' involvement in service delivery efforts; and push for decentralization by csos and the media as well as full implementation of the local government Act.*

#### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *Grievant Redress System introduced though partial and ineffective; non-governmental initiatives like civic participation, especially youth participation yielding partial and limited, replicable results.*

#### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*Examples of good practices and approaches to overcoming challenges in public service provision taken up by Transparency International Pakistan include:*

- *Citizen Engagement: Actively involving the public in decision-making processes and feedback loops to enhance service quality through workshops, trainings and dialogues. These initiatives often empower citizens to have a direct say in policies, service improvements, and resource allocation. In doing so, they not only enhance service quality but also build trust between the government and the public. Recently, The Auditor General of Pakistan introduced an innovative approach to actively involve citizens in the audit activities conducted by the office. These participatory sessions include different CSOs to take part in budgetary decision-making process.*



## **Transparency Maroc:**

*Awareness raising and advocacy based on studies and surveys carried out.*

## **Transparency International Cambodia:**

*There have been some outstanding practices and approaches taken to addressing these issues:*

- *The Social Accountability Framework: It creates a platform for dialogues between citizens, citizens' groups, and public institutions to provide feedback, monitor service delivery, and report on any issues and concerns. TIC has also collaborated with MoI to roll out a mobile application, "Our Voice or Mate Yerng". It is an interactive platform which citizens can report feedback and suggestions as well as allowing respective public service providers make responses to those feedback and suggestions.*

## **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Citizen Engagement and Feedback Mechanisms: Initiatives like the Citizens' Budget and Town Hall Meetings provide citizens with opportunities to engage with government officials, express their concerns, and provide feedback on public service delivery.*
- *Public Awareness Campaigns: Information campaigns educate citizens about their rights, available public services, and how to access them, addressing the practical barrier of public awareness.*
- *Cultural Sensitivity: Efforts to make public services culturally sensitive, such as multilingual services and community engagement, ensure that diverse cultural and linguistic groups can access and benefit from these services.*

## **Community – user driven approaches**

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

*The government of Rwanda has implemented a range of innovative practices and approaches to enhance the provision of public services, overcoming various challenges. Notable strategies include establishing one-stop service centers for streamlined access to services, implementing the Ubudehe categorization system to target vulnerable households, and investing in e-Government initiatives to digitize service delivery. These strategies and solutions include an approach known as "home-grown solutions" to improve service delivery, tailored to its specific context and challenges. These solutions encompass policies and strategies designed within the Rwandan framework, taking into account the nation's unique historical, cultural, and socioeconomic circumstances. Key aspects of Rwanda's home-grown solutions for enhanced service delivery include:*

- *Community Engagement and Umuganda: Rwanda's home-grown approach emphasizes active community participation, as seen in Umuganda, a monthly community service day where citizens contribute to public works and community development projects.*
- *Girinka Program: A program providing cows to vulnerable families, is a home-grown solution aimed at improving livelihoods, nutrition, and economic stability within communities.*
- *Mutuelle de Santé (Community Based Health Insurance Scheme): A home-grown health insurance initiative, ensuring health coverage and affordable healthcare services for citizens, thereby addressing health-related challenges and promoting well-being.*

- *Gacaca Courts: Gacaca courts were a home-grown response to address the post-genocide justice and reconciliation process, involving community-led trials to expedite justice and foster reconciliation at the grassroots level.*

#### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Community-Based Health Planning and Services (CHPS): CHPS initiatives bring healthcare closer to rural communities by establishing community health posts. This addresses the geographic disparities in healthcare access.*

#### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *Encourage citizen participation and civil society in the oversight of health services to detect and report corruption.*
- *Budget allocated to the education sector: equitable distribution of the budget according to the sectors concerned. Users in these sectors must advocate for a better distribution of the budget in question.*

### **Anticorruption – Prevention and detection**

#### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

- *Whistleblower Protection Laws: Whistleblower protection laws protect individuals who report illegal or unethical activities within an organization or government from retaliation. These laws provide legal safeguards and, in some cases, rewards for those who expose wrongdoing, promoting transparency and accountability. Transparency International Pakistan aware citizen about this law and encourages them to report and highlight the corruption. Transparency International Pakistan is continuously conducting the sessions to raise awareness about this law and encourage citizen to use this law and to ensure transparency and public institutions. According to National Corruption Perception Survey 2022 (NCPS) conducted by Transparency International (TI) Pakistan, 14.9 survey-takers think that in order to curb corruption, government should encourage and reward those who point out the corruption.*
- *Right to Information Laws and Acts: Transparency International Pakistan through its workshops, encourages citizen to use Right to Information laws and acts on national and provincial level to acquire information from government officials. Right to Information (RTI) laws empower citizens to access government-held information, thereby ensuring transparency. Citizens can request and receive information about government actions, decisions, and spending. This transparency holds officials accountable, reduces corruption, and promotes good governance. It enables informed citizen participation, contributing to a more open and democratic society.*

#### **TI – Jordan:**

- *Anti-Corruption Measures: The Jordanian government has established anti-corruption bodies and promoted transparency in public service delivery. Measures such as online procurement systems and whistleblower protection systems have been implemented to combat corruption.*
- *Decentralization: To address regional disparities, Jordan has initiated a process of decentralization, devolving certain administrative functions and resources to local municipalities. This allows for better tailoring of services to local needs.*
- *Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs): In sectors like healthcare and education, the government has encouraged public-private partnerships to improve the quality and accessibility of services. These partnerships can bring in private sector expertise and investment.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Anti-Corruption Measures: The establishment of institutions like the Office of the Special Prosecutor and efforts to increase transparency through initiatives like the Ghana Open Data Initiative and e-procurement systems help combat corruption and enhance accountability.*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *It should also be mentioned that a Public Procurement Code has been adopted, although there are still clear deficits in the provision of public procurement and public procurement. A law on the Code of Transparency and Accountability in Public Financial Management has been enacted since 2017, followed by the establishment of a National Transparency Commission responsible for monitoring and implementing the said law. (<https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2017/03/31/loi-10-2017-du-9-mars-2017-portant-code-relatif-la-transparence-et-la-responsabilite/#:~:text=31%20MARS%202017-.LOI%2010%2D2017%20DU%209%20MARS%202017%20PORTANT%20CODE%20RELATIF%20C3%80%20LA%20TRANSPARENCE%20ET%20C3%80%20LA%20RESPONSABILIT%C3%89%20DANS%20LA%20GESTION%20DES%20FINANCES%20PUBLIQUES,-Dans%20le%20cadre>)*

<https://cntr.cg/#:~:text=DOCUMENTS%20OFFICIELS-.COMMISSION%20NATIONALE%20DE%20TRANSPARENCE%20ET%20DE%20RESPONSABILIT%C3%89%20DANS%20LA%20GESTION%20DES,%C3%A0%20la%20bonne%20gouvernance%20des%20finances%20publiques%20en%20R%C3%A9publique%20du%20CONGO,-CONTEXTE%20ET%20JUSTIFICATION>.

*Tags: The authorities' calls to order against public officials are recurrent but do not have much effect. Transparency and accountability in public governance remain incantatory and empty demands. By Decree No. 2019-391 of 28 December 2019, a new body, the High Authority for the Fight against Corruption (HALC), was set up to replace the last two that had shown their limits. The Anti-Corruption Act of 2009 was replaced by Law No. 9-2022 of 11 March 2022 on the prevention and fight against corruption and related offences. Despite these initiatives, poor practices remain in the provision of public services.*

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *The fight against corruption in the health sector is essential to improve access to health care, the quality of services and health outcomes for the Malagasy population.*
- *Strengthen transparency and accountability in the management of public health resources.*
- *Establish mechanisms for reporting corruption and protect whistleblowers.*

### **Transparency International Kenya:**

- *Corruption reporting/whistleblowing mechanisms by CSOs like TI-Kenya and public complaints systems by the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission, Ombudsman/Commission on Administrative Justice.*
- *Digitisation-Use of ICT systems to avail some services 'Huduma' public service centres that provide one service point for various government services such as the revenue authority, lands services, civil registration etc.*

## **Transparency International Defence & Security:**

*Whilst addressing the impact of corruption on achieving the SDGs is indisputably important in every sector, addressing corruption in the defence and security sectors is a crucial step in achieving the Agenda 2030 which frequently remains underrecognized. Here are five recommendations on how we can prioritise anti-corruption in order to develop effective, accountable and inclusive institutions by 2030:*

- *Reinforce anti-corruption commitments to SDG 16 in central policy documents: Declare countering corruption in defence and security a priority action in forthcoming high-level policy documents, and renew commitments to achieving SDG 16 and SDG 16.5 on international, national and subnational levels. Tackling corruption in defence and security must become a pressing priority in any development agenda.*
- *Improve governance and transparency in defence and security: Enhance oversight, increase transparency, and establish independent entities with the authority to monitor and investigate corruption cases in the defence and security sectors. The Governance Defence Integrity Index (GDI) offers a set of standards for good governance in these sectors that can be used as guidance.*
- *Integrate anti-corruption into security sector reform (SSR): Embed anti-corruption thoroughly throughout SSR policies and programmes to effectively address corruption and build a more accountable, effective and inclusive security sector.*
- *Conduct comprehensive corruption risk assessments: Integrate corruption risk assessments in the planning and implementation of any governance or development programmes related to defence and security, as well as into military operations and UN peacekeeping missions, in order to increase awareness and build in mitigation for corruption risk from the start. This can be conducted as part of wider political economy or conflict analyses.*
- *Enhance whistleblower protection: Develop and enforce mechanisms to enable and protect individuals reporting corruption. Whistleblower protection in the defence and security sectors should be the same as in any other public sector, despite the higher degrees of hierarchy and secrecy in these sectors. Establish gender-sensitive and secure channels for anonymous and safe reporting.*

## **To what extent does corruption play a role in excluding individuals and households from accessing public services?**

Corruption enables the exclusion from the most vulnerable and marginalized groups to access public services. The main manifestations of corrupt practices are: bribery and extortion, unequal distribution of resources, nepotism and favouritism, distorted allocation of funds, inefficient resource allocation. These practices generate an erosion of trust, increase inequalities and inhibit development.

## **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *Everyone is complaining about the deterioration of the services provided in terms of quality and their suitability to the fast-paced and ever-changing reality of life. The government's response to the needs of the people is very slow, and the reason is largely due to the dominance of some companies in providing these services and basic goods through the government to the people.*

*Corruption has a significant impact, whether in excluding deserving people or oppressing undeserving segments, with the aim of financial gain.*

#### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi**

- *Corruption plays a role in the exclusion of individuals and households because to obtain a public service it requires bribes, so an individual who has not paid the bribes will not receive the service. It should be noted that in many cases public services are free.*

#### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Corruption limits the quality and adequacy of public services; diverts resources from services, and also prevents the provision of services in some locations, thus increasing poverty levels among populations.*

#### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *70.9 percent of service recipients were victims of corruption according to national household survey on corruption in service sectors; 72.1 percent of those who paid bribes did so because "service denied without it". <https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/articles/household-survey/6521>*

#### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

- *Corruption significantly contributes to the exclusion of individuals and households from accessing public services in Pakistan, as it does in many nations worldwide. Within Pakistan, corruption has a substantial role in restricting access to public services and worsening economic inequalities. This predicament is intricate and manifests in several ways. Corruption often commences at the grassroots level through practices like bribery and extortion. Individuals seeking fundamental services, such as healthcare, education, or public utilities, frequently find themselves coerced into paying bribes to government officials. This financial burden disproportionately affects low-income households, discouraging them from seeking essential services. Corruption also affects the distribution of government aid and social welfare programs. Funds intended for poverty alleviation and support for vulnerable populations are susceptible to embezzlement or redirection, diminishing the effectiveness of these programs. This exclusionary practice perpetuates poverty and impedes the government's efforts to uplift marginalized communities. During floods in 2022, only 19% of survey-takers of NCPS 2022 think government institutions worked effectively during the disaster. In the justice system, corruption can lead to delays in court proceedings, making it difficult for individuals, especially those with limited financial resources, to access justice. Bribes may be demanded at various stages of legal processes, hindering citizens' ability to seek justice. Judiciary is considered the second most corrupt sector in the country, according to NCPS 2022.*

#### **TI - Jordan:**

*Corruption can play a significant role in excluding individuals and households from accessing public services in Jordan, as it creates barriers that hinder equitable and fair access to essential services. Here's how corruption can impact service access:*

- *Bribery and Extortion: In some cases, individuals may be forced to pay bribes or extorted by corrupt officials to access public services. This creates a financial barrier that excludes those who cannot afford to make these illegal payments.*
- *Unequal Distribution of Resources: Corruption can result in resources not being distributed fairly. If resources are diverted or allocated based on corrupt practices, certain regions or communities may receive preferential treatment while others are left underserved, creating disparities in access to services.*
- *Nepotism and Favoritism: Corrupt practices, such as nepotism and favoritism, can lead to opportunities being given to individuals with connections rather than those who are most in need. This exclusionary behavior can affect access to education, healthcare, employment, and other public services.*
- *Distorted Allocation of Funds: Corrupt practices may divert funds meant for public services into the pockets of corrupt officials or entities, resulting in insufficient funding for the delivery of services. This can lead to subpar service quality and limited access.*
- *Inefficient Resource Allocation: When public funds are misappropriated due to corruption, it can lead to inefficient resource allocation. This means that resources may not be directed to the areas or programs where they are most needed, further limiting access for marginalized communities.*
- *Erosion of Trust: Widespread corruption erodes public trust in government institutions. When individuals perceive public servants as corrupt and untrustworthy, they may be reluctant to seek out or engage with public services, resulting in exclusion.*
- *Inhibited Development: Corruption can hinder economic and social development, reducing the government's capacity to invest in and improve public services. As a result, the overall quality and availability of services may be compromised, affecting access for everyone.*

### **Transparency Maroc:**

*Corruption reinforce the tendency to waste public resources. the most devastating effects:*

- *lower product quality and higher prices*
- *Substandard and hazardous infrastructure,*
- *inoperative justice,*
- *inefficient health system,*
- *deficient education system, and*
- *Loss of citizens' confidence in the State.*

### **Transparency International Cambodia**

- *Corruption is a significant problem in Cambodia and has been linked to the limited access to public services. According to Transparency International's Corruption Perceptions Index 2022, Cambodia received a score of 24 (out of 100) and was ranked 150 out of 180 countries, indicating a high level of corruption. Corruption is particularly problematic in the provision of public services such as healthcare, education, public services and justice. Individuals who lack political connections or social status may find it challenging to access these services without paying bribes. Additionally, corrupt officials may divert funds meant for public services into their personal accounts, leading to a lack of resources for these services. Corruption plays a significant role in excluding individuals and households from accessing public services in Cambodia. The poor are particularly vulnerable to this exclusion, which leads to further poverty*



and marginalization. More efforts need to be made to combat corruption in Cambodia to ensure equitable access to public services.

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

Corruption plays a significant role in excluding individuals and households from accessing public services in Ghana. The extent of this exclusion can be quite substantial due to various forms of corruption that hinder service accessibility. Here are some ways corruption affects access to public services:

- *Bribery: Corrupt officials may demand bribes from individuals seeking public services. When people cannot afford these bribes, they may be denied access to services, particularly in healthcare, education, legal, police, passport, land etc.*
- *Embezzlement: Funds allocated for public services may be embezzled or misapplied leading to a shortage of resources for service provision. This can result in service unavailability or inadequacy, particularly in poorer less endowed regions.*
- *Nepotism and Favouritism: Appointments and promotions based on personal connections or political affiliations, rather than merit, can lead to unequal access to public services. Well-connected individuals may receive preferential treatment, while others are excluded.*
- *Red Tape and Administrative Delays: Corruption and inefficiency in bureaucratic processes can lead to lengthy delays in obtaining services, making access cumbersome and frustrating.*
- *Misallocation of Resources: Corrupt practices can lead to resources being allocated to projects or regions where they are not needed, while underserved areas remain neglected.*
- *Distorted Procurement: Corrupt practices in procurement can lead to the purchase of substandard equipment or services, adversely affecting service quality.*
- *Undermining Trust: Corruption erodes trust in public institutions, and individuals may be discouraged from seeking public services due to a belief that their needs will not be met fairly.*
- *Diversion of Benefits: In social welfare programs, corrupt practices may divert benefits away from the intended beneficiaries, leaving vulnerable individuals and households without the support they require.*

Evidence indicates that corruption makes it even more difficult for marginalised groups to access justice and public services or to participate meaningfully in politics and business. As such, corruption has served as a vehicle for discrimination; it often defines how certain groups and individuals are granted or denied access to goods, services, and opportunities on the basis of their identity. According to Afrobarometer survey report on the effects of corruption on access to public services, the following observations were gathered:

- *The police is the institution that the largest number of citizens report bribing to access services. Among key public officials, the police, judges and magistrates, Members of Parliament, civil servants, and tax officials are most widely perceived as corrupt.*
- *Perceived corruption among the police has declined modestly compared to 2017.*
- *Among key public institutions, the Army, the president, and religious leaders are the most trusted.*
- *Compared to 2017, popular trust in the president, Parliament, and courts has declined by more than 10 percentage points. [https://www.afrobarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/ab\\_r8\\_presentation\\_corruption\\_03122019.pdf](https://www.afrobarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/ab_r8_presentation_corruption_03122019.pdf)*
- *Again, general observations of corruption are made of other public institutions that demand bribes before rendering services for citizens. Specific mentions can be made of the Ghana Passports Office who demand bribes from citizens before processing passport documents. This led to the sacking of some perceived individuals who are suspected to perpetrate the act.*

<https://www.myjoyonline.com/foreign-affairs-minister-fumes-sacks-overstaying-officers-at-passport-office-over-suspected-extortion/#:~:text=National-.Foreign%20Affairs%20Minister%20fumes%2C%20sacks%20overstaying%20officers,Passport%20Office%20over%20suspected%20extortion&text=Minister%20of%20Foreign%20Affairs%20and,practices%20within%20the%20Passport%20Office> .

- Other public institutions who have faced corruption allegations in recent years and blamed for most corruption offences are the Ghana Education Service, who are identified with corruption offences in such as student enrolment, procurement breaches and teacher transfer dishonesty. <https://corruptionwatchghana.org/2020/06/19/ghanas-education-is-the-root-of-ghanas-corruption-ghanas-major-challenge/>
- There have also been high-level offences committed by members of the executive which led to the resignation of the immediate past sanitation minister. The minister was charged by the Office of the Special Prosecutor(OSP) as having in her possession some unsubstantiated amount of money <https://www.graphic.com.gh/news/general-news/osp-petitions-cj-to-remove-judge-on-cecilia-dapaah-case.html#:~:text=Background,%241%20million%20in%20her%20house> .
- Other institutions such as the Ghana Revenue Authority (GRA), the Customs Exercise and Preventive Service (CEPS), the Ghana Standards Authority (GSA), the Food and Drugs Authority among others are popular institutions associated with corruption by the general public and have some evidence of offences associated with them.

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

Corruption can play a significant role in excluding individuals and households from accessing public services. The different ways in which corruption can be a driver of these practices are:

- *Favouritism and clientelism: When corrupt officials privilege certain individuals or groups in exchange for bribes or personal favours, it creates inequalities in access to public services. In this case, persons who are unable to pay these bribes or who do not have relations with the latter are systematically excluded from their right of access to these public services.*
- *Embezzlement: When funds intended for services are misappropriated by corrupt officials, this can result in poor quality of service and unavailability of service to all. As a result, individuals and households are confronted with poor quality and sometimes even insufficient infrastructure.*
- *It can also be said that this exclusion manifests itself in fraud in the education system (payment of bribes to obtain a diploma) in the health sector (payment of bribes to benefit from quality health care). . (<https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2023/05/13/riposte-contre-la-covid-19-des-milliards-envoles/#:~:text=13%20MAI%202023-.RIPOSTE%20CONTRE%20LA%20COVID%2D19%20%3A%20DES%20MILLIARDS%20ENVOL%2C3%20%89S,-R%2C%20A9alis%2C%20A9%20dans%20le>).*
- *Corruption can also lead to higher costs to access certain public services. For example, crooked officials may demand additional payments for obtaining an identity document (e.g. passport and national identity card). This makes these essential services unaffordable for low-income people.*
- *Corruption leads to a lack of bias and fairness in the processing of cases and the provision of services to users, thus depriving entire populations of quality public services. The almost systematic corruption of State personnel has a strong impact on the access of the greatest number of people to public services, because the choices made for the delivery of these services are not objective and obey criteria of a mercantile and other nature which, in the long run, discourage citizens from taking steps towards public services. The lack of exemplarity and accountability reinforces this observation of abandonment on the part of the population. This observation is confirmed during the entrance exams in certain administrations, with results*



*often overused and giving rise to a truncated selection. This situation is particularly evident in the recruitment of members of the security forces, where the choices made are tribal and ethnic, thus excluding a large segment of the population.*

#### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *Corruption plays a significant role in excluding individuals and households from access to public health services. The ramifications of corruption in the health sector are profound, with direct consequences on citizens' ability to receive quality care.*
- *One of the most common mechanisms of corruption in healthcare is financial extortion. Individuals and households may find themselves in situations where they are forced to pay bribes or illicit payments to access health services. Even when health care is supposed to be free, these unofficial payments create a considerable financial barrier for many people, especially the poorest. The consequences are severe, as access to health care is essential to ensure the health and well-being of the population.*
- *Corruption can lead to the misappropriation of funds allocated to health facilities. Money intended for the purchase of medicines, medical equipment and infrastructure improvements can be mismanaged or misappropriated due to corrupt practices. This results in shortages of medicines, medical equipment, and other essential supplies, severely limiting the quality of health care. As a result, individuals and households are deprived of access to quality health care, putting their health at risk.*
- *Corruption also creates inequalities in access to health care. People with financial resources or political connections have an advantage in getting better quality services, while the most vulnerable individuals and households are left behind. This inequity exacerbates already existing health disparities, contributing to the marginalization of disadvantaged groups.*
- *The quality of health care is also affected by corruption. When health professionals are appointed or promoted based on favouritism or corruption rather than merit, it can lead to a decline in the quality of care. Individuals and households are at risk of receiving poorer quality of care, which has negative consequences for their health. When corruption is widespread, it can undermine patients' trust in the healthcare system, leading them to seek lower quality care, delay seeking care, or avoid public healthcare facilities altogether.*
- *Corruption also affects the proper functioning of the health system as a whole. It undermines resource management, disrupts service planning and delivery, and fuels a culture of impunity. A dysfunctional health system is less able to respond effectively to the needs of the population, leading to a deterioration in the quality of care and unequal access to services.*

*According to the latest survey carried out by Transparency International Initiative Madagascar in terms of proportion and significantly, more inhabitants of rural areas than urban dwellers and more women than men respectively note the existence of discrimination/exclusion in relation to access to the service of education because of corruption. The latter thus plays a major role in the exclusion of individuals and households from access to education services if there are:*

- *Favouritism: in the absence of a competition to obtain a vacant position, for example, lack of an anti-corruption policy prohibiting the integration of a family member or acquaintance into the service, discrimination on the basis of gender, race, etc.*
- *Weakness and absence of effective practice of the anti-corruption law.*
- *Weakness of State institutions and thus of the rule of law.*
- *Non-application of the law against gender-based violence*

### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- *Corruption has played an important role in the exclusion of individuals by allowing the financial means allocated to the inclusion of the vast majority of people to be diverted.*

### **Transparency International Kenya:**

- *Significant - most people are unable to pay for bribes to access services, and thus many are turned back and denied services when they can't pay a bribe.*

## **How does corruption affect the delivery of public services to population groups in your country?**

### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *Everyone is complaining about the deterioration of the services provided in terms of quality and their suitability to the fast-paced and ever-changing reality of life. The government's response to the needs of the people is very slow, and the reason is largely due to the dominance of some companies in providing these services and basic goods through the government to the people. Poor services provided, impunity for corrupt contractors.*

### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi**

- *Unavailability of services. Lack of transparency in the allocation of services (water). Poor school performance.*

### **Transparency International Defence & Security:**

- *Corruption deepens social inequalities: In contexts in which corruption is prevalent on the frontline of service delivery, it can mean that only those who are part of corrupt networks and/or can afford to pay for access to services get access to them or get privileged access at least. This intersects with other inequalities that are barriers to access to services such as gender, race, sexual identity etc.*
- *If we define the provision of defence and security services as a public service, then corruption also intersects with the delivery of this service. In cases in which security forces become co-opted by a political, economic or ethnic group and only provide protection to those who pay them to do so, corruption has undermined the maintenance of basic human security.*

### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Corruption limits the quality and adequacy of public services; diverts resources from services, and also prevents the provision of services in some locations, thus increasing poverty levels among populations.*
- *Also, corruption was a major cause of the Liberian civil society and continues to be a major factor making the peace of the country fragile.*

## Transparency International Bangladesh:

- *Impact of corruption in service delivery is discriminatory. The rate of victimisation of corruption among the rural households, for instance, is significantly 10 percent higher than urban. The burden of bribery in terms of the proportion of average annual income is seven times higher (2.1 percent against 0.3 percent) on the lower income category of households (annual income up to Tk 24,000) compared to the higher income households (Tk 85,001 or more).*
- *The discriminatory nature of corruption is further manifested in terms of victimisation of households headed by persons with disabilities (PWD). 80.3 percent of households headed by persons with disabilities were victims of corruption, compared to the national average of 70.6 percent. In terms of bribery alone, the rate of victimisation is 51.8 percent for PWD-headed households compared to the overall rate of 39.8 percent. <https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/articles/household-survey/6521>*

## Transparency International Rwanda:

*Corruption significantly impacts the delivery of public services to the population in Rwanda, posing detrimental effects on society, governance, economic development, and public trust. The Government of Rwanda has demonstrated commendable efforts to fighting corruption at institutional and at operational level as well as in all its forms. Commendable efforts to fight against corruption in Rwanda are evidenced by having legal, policy and institutional structures in place. Despite Rwanda's international and regional reputation of being ranked for long time among least corrupted countries in Africa, due to its zero tolerance towards corruption, especially through good governance and accountability, corruption still exists in various forms and size (petty and grand). Unfortunately, bribery in service delivery is the form of corruption most frequently encountered by citizens. Here are some ways corruption affects public service delivery in Rwanda:*

- *Diversion of Resources: Corrupt practices often involve embezzlement, misappropriation, or diversion of public funds meant for public services. This diversion deprives the intended recipients of the benefits that should have been provided.*
- *Inequality and Discrimination: Corruption can lead to unequal distribution of services, favouring those who pay bribes or have connections, while disadvantaged individuals and communities face discrimination and limited access to essential services.*
- *Weakening of Institutions: Corruption weakens the efficiency and effectiveness of public institutions responsible for service delivery. It erodes trust in these institutions and compromises their ability to function impartially and transparently.*
- *Reduced Service Quality: Bribes or kickbacks to access services can compromise the quality of the services provided. Resources that should be allocated for improvement and maintenance may be diverted for personal gain instead.*
- *Impact on Health and Education: Corruption in healthcare and education can be particularly damaging. It may lead to the misallocation of resources, Gender Based Corruption, hiring based on nepotism rather than merit, and procurement of substandard materials, affecting the quality of education and healthcare services.*
- *Undermining Rule of Law: Corruption undermines the rule of law, as it encourages a culture of impunity and disregards established legal and ethical standards. This erodes the foundation of a just and accountable society.*

*Efforts to combat corruption in Rwanda include strict anti-corruption legislation, robust enforcement mechanisms, education and awareness campaigns, promoting a culture of ethics and integrity, and encouraging citizen engagement and oversight. Addressing corruption is crucial to enhance the effectiveness and equity of public service delivery, ultimately contributing to the well-being and development of the Rwandan population.*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*Corruption significantly affects the delivery of public services to population groups in Pakistan, leading to negative consequences for the economy, society, and the overall well-being of its citizens. While some progress has been made in addressing corruption, it remains a pervasive challenge in the country, impacting various sectors of public service provision.*

- *Corruption exacerbates inequality in the delivery of public services. Those with resources or connections may be able to bribe their way to faster or better services, leaving marginalized and vulnerable population groups at a disadvantage. For example, in healthcare, well-off individuals pay bribes to secure faster access to medical treatment, while those without the means suffer longer wait times or substandard care. In TI Pakistan NCPS, health sector usually comes at the top in terms of the most corrupt sectors.*
- *Corruption diverts resources away from essential public services. Funds intended for improving healthcare, education, and infrastructure often end up in the pockets of corrupt officials and intermediaries. This misallocation of resources not only deprives the population of much-needed services but also perpetuates a cycle of poverty and underdevelopment. One of the most vulnerable sectors is the public procurement, where compliance with the procurement rules is negligible in the award of contracts.*
- *Marginalized and vulnerable population groups, such as women, minorities, and those living in rural areas, are often more severely affected by corruption. They face additional barriers to accessing public services and are more likely to be subjected to demands for bribes or face discrimination within corrupt systems.*

### **TI - Jordan:**

*Corruption can have a significant impact on the delivery of public services to various population groups in Jordan. The effects of corruption on public service delivery are often not uniform and can disproportionately affect vulnerable and marginalized communities. Here's how corruption can impact different population groups in Jordan:*

#### *Low-Income and Vulnerable Groups:*

- *Financial Barriers: Low-income individuals and vulnerable groups may be forced to pay bribes to access essential services, such as healthcare, education, or social assistance. This creates a financial barrier that can exclude those who cannot afford to make illegal payments.*
- *Reduced Service Quality: Funds meant for public services may be embezzled or misappropriated through corrupt practices, leading to lower service quality, which particularly affects those who depend on public services for their well-being.*

#### *Rural and Underserved Areas:*

- *Resource Diversion: Corrupt practices can divert resources away from rural and underserved areas, resulting in inadequate infrastructure, limited access to healthcare, education, and other essential services.*
- *Neglected Development: Rural regions may experience slower development due to corruption, which can limit the availability and quality of services in these areas.*

#### *Minority and Disadvantaged Groups:*

- *Exclusion through Discrimination: Corruption can lead to discriminatory practices, with opportunities and services being distributed based on nepotism, favoritism, or ethnicity. This can exclude minority and disadvantaged groups.*

#### *Women:*

- *Gender Discrimination: Corruption can exacerbate gender inequalities in access to services. Women may face additional challenges when trying to access services due to discriminatory practices related to corruption.*

#### *Refugees:*

- *Resource Constraints: Corruption within organizations or agencies responsible for refugee assistance can result in limited resources being directed toward refugee populations, affecting their access to vital services like healthcare, education, and employment.*

#### *Youth:*

- *Reduced Opportunities: Corruption can lead to fewer opportunities for youth, such as educational access or employment, as these may be influenced by corrupt practices like nepotism, favouritism, or bribery.*

### **Transparency Maroc:**

*Corruption is one of the main obstacles to our country's development because it:*

- *weakens public policies, development plans and programs,*
- *undermines the right of citizens to enjoy their fundamental rights, and*
- *hinders investment and free initiative.*

### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

*Corruption has significant impacts on the delivery of public services to population groups in Cambodia.*

- *It undermines transparency, accountability, and efficiency in government institutions, resulting in a lack of trust among citizens in these institutions to provide services. As a result, corruption poses a significant obstacle to the provision of basic services such as health care, education, administrative services, and social protection to disadvantaged groups.*
- *Moreover, corruption erodes trust in the government and state institutions, impacting economic growth and undermining efforts to develop sustainable policies to combat complex issues such as poverty.*

- *The consequences of corruption are particularly harmful to vulnerable communities that rely on social services, such as women, children, and people living in poverty.*

*Overall, corruption has a detrimental impact on the development of public service delivery in Cambodia. A comprehensive strategy aimed at increasing transparency, strengthening accountability, and implementing good governance is necessary if Cambodia seeks to improve public service delivery to disadvantaged populations.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

*Corruption has a detrimental impact on the delivery of public services to various population groups in Ghana. Its effects are widespread and affect different segments of the population in distinct ways.*

- *Vulnerable and Marginalized Groups: Vulnerable and marginalized groups, such as low-income communities and rural populations, often face more significant obstacles in accessing public services due to corruption. This includes difficulties in accessing healthcare, education, and social welfare programs.*
- *Quality Disparities: When funds meant for public services are siphoned off through corrupt practices, the quality of services available to vulnerable populations may be significantly lower, exacerbating existing disparities.*
- *Youth and Education Seekers: Corruption within the education sector can hinder the educational pursuits of students. This may involve bribery for exam results, admission to schools, or the provision of educational materials, which can lead to unfair advantages for those who can pay.*
- *Healthcare Recipients: Corruption can lead to bribery or extortion by healthcare providers, preventing individuals from receiving timely and necessary medical treatment, particularly in public healthcare facilities.*
- *Medication Shortages: Embezzlement of healthcare funds can lead to shortages of essential medicines and medical equipment, adversely affecting healthcare access and quality.*
- *Entrepreneurs and Businesses: Businesses often face extortion and bribery demands from government officials to expedite processes like permits and licenses. This not only increases their operational costs but also hampers fair competition.*
- *Civil Servants and Public Employees: Public servants and employees may encounter workplace corruption, including issues related to promotions, recruitment, and assignment of duties. Such practices can lead to disillusionment and a loss of motivation among the workforce.*
- *Women and Gender Disparities: Corruption can reinforce gender disparities when women are particularly vulnerable to sexual harassment, bribery, and discrimination in accessing public services, such as healthcare and education.*
- *Minority and Ethnic Groups: Discrimination and Exclusion: Certain minority and ethnic groups may experience discrimination and exclusion when corrupt practices result in preferential treatment for those with political connections, leading to unequal access to services.*
- *Pension and Social Welfare Corruption: Corruption in the distribution of pensions and social welfare benefits can negatively affect the well-being of the elderly population, who may find themselves without the support they need.*

*According to Afrobarometer survey report on the effects of corruption on access to public services ([https://www.afrobarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/ab\\_r8\\_presentation\\_corruption\\_03122019.pdf](https://www.afrobarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/ab_r8_presentation_corruption_03122019.pdf)) the following observations*



were gathered "The police is the institution that the largest number of citizens report bribing to access services.

- Rural residents and less-educated citizens are more likely to pay bribes to the police.
- Urban residents and highly educated citizens are more likely to pay bribes for identity documents.
- Men are more likely than women to pay bribes for all services.
- Youth are somewhat more likely than older citizens to pay bribes for most services (except to avoid problems with the police).

Corruption lessens the opportunities of realising the Sustainable Development. It is obvious that corruption in education for instance in the form of irregularities in the areas of cash management, procurement and stores, contract management, payroll, asset management, rent payments, advances and tax affects access to education, particularly of the girl child and persons living with various forms of disabilities.

- Corruption in education also decreases the available spaces and the opportunities for increased access, as these monies that are misappropriated could be used to partially resolve some challenges in the sector.

With regards the health sector, corruption leading to lack of access to quality healthcare could be dire and life threatening. For example:

- Lack of healthcare facilities in some districts and communities resulting in the movements of sick persons and pregnant women and girls to far away districts and communities for healthcare services sometimes results in loss of lives and also complications in pregnancies;
- Lack of healthcare personnel in some districts and communities due to the refusal of health personnel to work in remote places;
- Poor supervision of operations of healthcare facilities including health personnel, bad roads linking communities to healthcare facilities;
- Siting of hospitals which is sometimes based on politics rather than a need for a health facility;
- Poor management of the national health scheme which is eventually crippling the scheme, the effects of which will fall heavily on women, particularly, poor rural women, girls and other groups at risk of discrimination;
- Diversion of funds earmarked for health services into private pockets; amongst others all factors that could greatly deny women, girls and other groups at risk of discrimination access to quality health care in Ghana.

#### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- In the Republic of Congo, corruption is a major phenomenon that affects and negatively impacts the provision of public services to certain groups of the population. Corrupt officials often embezzle funds intended for public services. This means that some funds that are normally intended to improve the quality of certain educational or health infrastructures are diverted for personal gain, resulting in a reduction in the resources allocated to these sectors, thus affecting the daily lives of those populations who depend on these services. <https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2020/11/30/evaluation-des-risques-de-corruption-dans-le-processus-redd-en-republique-du-congo/>

- *The scourge limits the access of the greatest number of people to quality services in view of the low purchasing power and the particularly high level of poverty of the Congolese population in general.* <https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2020/05/11/rapport-sur-les-exercices-budgetaires-2017-2018-et-lequipement-de-quelques/>
- *This favouritism in the provision of public services is thus a source of exclusion for the many who do not have the capacity to put their hands in their pockets. But also, in the recruitment choices of state agents, corruption limits the criteria of objectivity and efficiency of the staff to whom this responsibility will be entrusted, with a significant impact on the quality of services. Also, the inadequacy of the control, retraining and training of public personnel considerably affects the proper provision of these services. For example, citizens' access to the free health measures decreed by the Executive and concerning the establishment of passports in particular, has been largely compromised by the lack of monitoring of the application of these measures, thus causing the misappropriation of funds to accompany their implementation. In the field of justice, too, the onerous nature of services affects the greatest number of people and thus reinforces the phenomenon of bribery and the like.* <https://rpdh-cg.org/news/2020/09/25/publiez-ce-que-vous-payez-congo-six-ans-de-suivi-dans-les-investissements-publics/>

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

*Corruption plays a major role in the way public health services are provided to population groups in Madagascar. The country faces serious corruption problems, which manifest themselves in the health sector, creating inequalities and hindering access to care for various vulnerable groups. Here's how corruption affects these specific population groups:*

- *Vulnerable populations: The most vulnerable populations, such as poor communities, pregnant women, children, and the elderly, are often the most affected by corruption. The extortion of illicit payments creates a significant financial barrier for these groups, preventing them from accessing essential health care. The unofficial costs associated with corruption can be prohibitive for these people, forcing them to choose between their basic needs and medical care.*
- *Rural and remote areas: Madagascar is a vast country with many remote rural areas. Corruption can exacerbate inequalities by diverting resources from areas that need them most. In addition, these regions are often more vulnerable to extortion of illicit payments, as they have fewer health care options and fewer financial resources to deal with these costs. This means that rural populations may be doubly disadvantaged when it comes to access to care.*
- *Ethnic minorities: Ethnic and cultural minorities can be particularly vulnerable to corruption, as they may face discrimination and inequitable treatment in the health system. Corruption can exacerbate these inequalities by favouring some populations at the expense of others, creating disparities based on ethnicity.*
- *Women: Women can be particularly affected by corruption in the health sector. Extortion of illicit payments or acts of corruption can discourage pregnant women from seeking antenatal care, giving birth in health facilities, or seeking postnatal care. These financial barriers and delays in seeking maternal care put the health of women and newborns at risk.*
- *Children: Children are vulnerable to the effects of corruption, as they often depend on public health care for their well-being. Corruption can lead to shortages of essential medicines, vaccines, and other medical supplies, which can have serious consequences for children's health. Quality issues and limited access to care can also hinder children's growth and development.*



- *Elderly: Older people are also affected by corruption, as they often need regular medical care. Extortion of illicit payments can exacerbate their financial precariousness and prevent them from receiving the care they need to maintain their health.*

*Corruption in the health sector is creating massive inequalities in access to public health care services in Madagascar. Vulnerable groups are often the most affected, with devastating consequences for their health and well-being. Corruption can deprive them of essential health care, force them to bear excessive financial costs, deter them from seeking medical care, or expose them to increased health risks. To address these inequalities and improve access to healthcare, anti-corruption measures, such as transparency, whistleblower protection and accountability, are essential. It is imperative to ensure that resources allocated to health are used equitably and for the benefit of all Malagasy citizens, regardless of their social status, ethnicity or place of residence.*

*The forced or voluntary practice of corruption has serious consequences not only on the administrative, financial, material and human management of the education system, but above all on the quality of education, with disastrous socio-economic impacts.*

- *The deterioration of the quality of teaching: the recruitment of incompetent agents motivated solely by job security has an impact on the quality of teaching. Similarly, the fact that some teachers have to take on extra jobs to make ends meet because of low pay also contributes to the deterioration in the quality of teaching.*
- *Increasing inequalities between rich and poor: Favouritism resulting from corruption exacerbates inequalities by favouring those who practice it. The latter will be able to circumvent the legally established rules. This is an obstacle to the principle of equal opportunities, which is sacrosanct to education. Thus, the poorest classes, due to a lack of resources, are the main victims of corruption. They will have fewer choices, and fewer opportunities to access essential services such as education.*
- *Reinforcing the culture of nepotism: The impact of corruption in schools is not only immediate, but also long-term. Indeed, the school's mission is to transmit the values and laws of society, to make these values understood and lived. If this school is permeated with nepotism and corruption, it risks transmitting bad examples and bad values to students who will reproduce these biased behaviors once they are integrated into working life.*
- *Hindrance to economic development: Education is responsible for participating in the empowerment and development of students in order to meet the needs of the labor market and the economy. Education is undoubtedly a factor in economic growth. Poor quality education will sooner or later have devastating repercussions on the economy.*
- *Dropping out of school*

#### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- *Corruption affects the delivery of public services by the fact that vulnerable groups do not have access to health care, higher education, agriculture as the funds allocated to support these vulnerable groups are diverted by public officials.*

### **Transparency International Kenya:**

- *Most people are unable to pay for bribes to access services, and thus many are turned back and denied services when they can't pay a bribe.*

### **What percentage of eligible individuals and households do not claim and/or benefit from public services in your country (non-take up)**

### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *Less than 20%. I do not have accurate statistics, but there are no marginalized groups. The problem lies in the difficulty of procedures for obtaining government services without an intermediary.*

### **Transparency International Defence & Security:**

*An example from our research on the human impact of defence sector corruption:*

- *Living and working in Kabul, the interviewee witnessed first-hand entire chains of corruption ingrained in the Afghan security sector. From the high-level, where a system of patronage kept Ministers, MPs and their networks in power through bribery and trading of political favours and influence, right down to lower-level officials who would siphon off public funds and solicit bribes from citizens in return for access to public services, corruption was endemic. The impact was felt most acutely by the ordinary citizens at the bottom of the 'chain', whose rights, protections and access to public funds and services were ultimately at stake as corruption both eroded the services and removed any chance of accountability. The interviewee described how families sent their sons to the military as a lifeline in the years before 2021 – it was the only way to get some income for the family to survive. But far from providing a livelihood for their families, soldiers were often left impoverished. As commanders skimmed money off budgets, soldiers were left to fund basic provisions that the military is usually expected to provide, including food, their travel to go home and see family, and even their military uniforms, from their own salaries. Even when killed in service, soldiers' families struggled to access the financial support they were entitled to as compensation, often finding that military commanders wouldn't sign a paper to say that the soldier had been killed until they received a bribe of up to \$700 from the family.*

### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Vast majority of the population in Liberia don't have access to good quality, reliable, and adequate basic social services.*

### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *Insignificant. Only 0.5 percent of surveyed households did not have interactions in any of the surveyed service sectors.*

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *In accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Rwanda, Article 27: All Rwandans have the right of equal access to the public service in accordance with their competence and abilities. In addition, Rwanda envisions to achieve 90% of citizens satisfaction with service delivery and 100% of all public services delivered online by 2024. The Rwanda Governance Board (RGB) is responsible for regularly monitoring the status of service delivery across sectors to assess the progress towards achieving national targets. RGB also has the powers to hold public and private institutions accountable and to request for administrative sanctions against defaulting institutions or staff members.*
- *(RGB) The Rwanda Social Protection Policy and its Strategic Plan 2019-2024 is cognizant of inclusivity and responds to the aspirations of the National Constitution's call which commits the sector to contribute to tackling different forms of vulnerabilities including disability, old age, supporting any other vulnerable persons. In its inclusive development character, the Social Protection Policy further responds to the regional and international commitments, respectively the East African Community and African Union agenda, visible in the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The overriding principle of the SDGs of "Leaving No One Behind", call for a more ambitious approach to social protection that is more inclusive and preventative in nature, providing an environment for protection from a range of social risks as well as being transformative for all citizens. The policy considers key international agreements such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), which identify social protection as a fundamental human right for all citizens. Rwanda's flagship social protection programme, Vision 2020 Umurenge (VUP), was first launched in 2008 to provide direct support for people living in extreme poverty who are unable to work or access micro-credit. This ensures that all citizens access the needed services regardless of their social or economic status.*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*According to Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey 2019 – 20:*

- *Not having Access to Basic Drinking Water Service: 6%*
- *Not having Access to Basic Sanitation Services: 32%*
- *Not having Access to Basic Hygiene Facility: 46%*
- *Not having Access to Clean Fuel and Technology: 37%*
- *Not having Access to Basic Education: 81%*
- *Not having Access to Primary Healthcare Services: 50%*
- *Not having Access to Basic Information Services: 67%*

### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *Effects of corruption on the development process are not limited on economic growth alone, but also on productive and social structures. which results in the majority of citizens living in conditions which do not allow them honest and decent access to public services.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Currently there are no specifically identified populations or individuals who are not covered by or do not benefit from public services in Ghana. All citizens including the vulnerable populations comprising of women, children and persons with disabilities are by law eligible to all public*

services in Ghana such as access to public education, hospitals, among others and there are several social protection programs that are specifically designed to enable the vulnerable population access to public services.

- Examples include the Ghana National Health Insurance (NHIA), the Free Compulsory Basic Education (FCUBE), the Ghana Free High School Education policy, among others and there are social policies that are specifically designed to cushion some vulnerable populations, the Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty (LEAP) program is a specific example of such. Ghana's Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty (LEAP) programme provides cash transfers to very poor people, particularly in households with orphans or vulnerable children, the elderly and people with extreme disabilities. Beneficiaries also receive free national health insurance. LEAP's objectives are to alleviate short-term poverty and to promote the development of human education, experience and abilities. The government-funded programme receives support from the World Bank and the UK's Department of International Development.

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

According to a national survey carried out by the Transparency International Madagascar association in 2023, at the level of the 06 provincial capitals:

- the majority of the 4,854 people surveyed (66%) have a level of education equivalent to or lower than lower secondary (middle school).
- 8% have never been to school.
- 94 people surveyed have already faced a refusal of enrolment of their child when approaching a school, the reasons for this are in particular: for 26 of them: school fees are incomplete; 15 people believe they have been discriminated against, 12 of which concern children living with a disability and 1 case a parent living with a disability; 7 cases in relation to unruly children, 7 incomplete or non-compliant files, 6 cases of child's age problem, full class sizes, insufficient level.
- There are even students who live 5km from the school.

### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- In the DRC, statistics do not exist, but we estimate that more than 70% of the population does not have access to basic services because of corruption.

**What are the barriers that hinder them from accessing public services to which they are entitled? How can non-take-up be reduced?**

## **Quality**

### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- In Kuwait, the problem is quality, not deprivation. Tightening oversight of service providers, digitizing them effectively, making government transactions transparent, and allowing civil society to monitor and be held accountable.

## Corruption

### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi**

- *Public ignorance. Impunity. Lack of legislation to protect whistleblowers. To reduce this, we need to mobilise citizens and raise awareness of their rights. We must also punish the guilty parties. Introduce a specific law on the protection of whistleblowers, as well as a law on access to information.*

### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Corruption is a major factor, coupled with poor leadership and lack of full implementation of decentralization policy.*

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *Corruption and Bribery: Instances of corruption within public service delivery can pose significant barriers, making it difficult for citizens to access services without paying illegal fees or bribes.*

*Addressing these barriers requires a holistic approach involving policy reforms, investment in infrastructure, awareness campaigns, citizen education, anti-corruption measures, and efforts to improve service quality and inclusivity. It's essential to prioritize the removal of these barriers to ensure equitable access to public services for all Rwandan citizens.*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In Pakistan, several barriers hinder eligible individuals and households from accessing public services to which they are entitled, resulting in a phenomenon known as non-take-up. These barriers are multifaceted and encompass social, economic, and administrative challenges. To reduce non-take-up and ensure that eligible individuals benefit from public services, several strategies can be employed.*

*Barriers to Accessing Public Services:*

- *Complex Application Procedures: Cumbersome and complicated application procedures can deter individuals from seeking public services. The bureaucratic red tape involved in accessing services such as social assistance or healthcare can be discouraging.*

### **TI Jordan:**

*Barriers to Accessing Public Services:*

1. *Bureaucratic Red Tape: Complex administrative procedures, paperwork, and long waiting times can deter people from applying for services.*

*Strategies to Reduce Non-Take-Up:*

2. *Streamlining Procedures: Simplifying administrative processes, reducing paperwork, and expediting service delivery can reduce bureaucratic barriers.*

3. *Anti-Corruption Measures: Implementing anti-corruption measures to reduce bribery and extortion can help eliminate financial and systemic barriers to accessing services.*

#### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *In Morocco, Corruption is persistent and rampant as evidenced by many indicators. Corruption, lack of accountability and impunity are at the source of social inequalities and difficulties in accessing public services.*

#### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

##### *Barriers:*

- *Corruption and bureaucracy: corrupt practices and bureaucratic obstacles can deter people from accessing services. The demand for bribes or time-consuming administrative procedures can discourage individuals.*
- *Lack of Trust: Low trust in public institutions can make people hesitant to use public services, fearing inefficiency or corruption.*

##### *Strategies:*

- *Enhance Transparency and Accountability: Implement anti-corruption measures and streamline bureaucratic processes to build trust in public institutions and make service delivery more efficient and transparent.*
- *Monitoring and Evaluation: Continuously monitor and evaluate service uptake and reasons for non-take-up to adjust strategies and interventions as needed.*

*Despite the implementation of the LEAP program, there still remain some unresolved challenges with the effectiveness. Low value of the cash transfers, irregular payments, travelling to collect cash grant, inadequate means of transport and lack of synergies with other social programmes, including health services and programmes for sustainable livelihoods were some of the main challenges identified as hindering the successful implementation of the program.*  
[https://ipcig.org/pub/eng/OP271\\_The\\_Impact\\_of\\_Ghana\\_s\\_LEAP\\_Programme.pdf](https://ipcig.org/pub/eng/OP271_The_Impact_of_Ghana_s_LEAP_Programme.pdf)

#### **TI España:**

##### *Barriers:*

- *Tedious processes and obsolete digital management platforms lead our "E-Administration" to be ranked fourth in the field of digital public services in the Digital Economy and Society Index (DESI) prepared by the European Commission. In other words, today it is not 100% digital.*

*To reduce non-attendance or non-use of public services, a series of measures should be taken, including:*

- *Ensuring the full digitalisation of the public sector with the aim of achieving greater streamlining.*
- *Reducing the bureaucratization to which some public services are subjected.*



## **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *Corruption: The scourge has reached such a level that it has become a social phenomenon; Its manifestations in public performances have become the norm and no longer significantly affect the collective consciousness, in an environment where staying away from acts of corruption makes the person concerned an outsider.*
- *Therefore, the judiciary must play its part and punish all the perpetrators of anti-values.*
- *At the administrative level, too, the hierarchy must set an example in monitoring the effective compliance with the established rule and in punishing abuses.*

## **Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *Recruitment: this is the responsibility of the Human Resources Department (HRD) in collaboration with the National Institute of Pedagogical Training (INFP) in Madagascar. Each SCOLAIRE Constituency is responsible for publishing the call for recruitment and the persons concerned submit their files to their level. After having approved these files, it is up to each CISCO to transmit them to the Regional Directorate of National Education (DREN) and the latter forwards them to the HRD. This process includes a high risk of corruption, particularly in terms of favouritism and bribery, as it is carried out every year and involves thousands of people. The "recruitment" link would thus be the most corrupt in the national education circuit because almost all the staff recruited are acquaintances or relations of education employees, despite people who are qualified and competent who do not have a chance for the position.*
- *Payment of Teachers' Grants: The payment of subsidized teachers is made every two months at the CISCO level (and not every month like other civil servants). But some CISCO staff members ask for a bribe before giving the voucher to the person concerned. Sometimes, these staff act under the orders of the head of CISCO himself, according to some school principals and teachers in a region. The processing of human resources files (reclassification, promotion, integration, retirement) The processing of all files relating to the professional career of human resources is one of the normal responsibilities of the Human Resources Department. It should be done automatically at the system level, but sometimes it doesn't. Teachers/administrative staff prepare their files and send them to the CISCO level. From the visa to the delivery to the DREN, most of the people concerned resort to bribes. And all the way to the top of the ladder to be able to enjoy their rights. When preparing the files, some CISCO leaders ask for money with each signature.*
- *Assignment or redeployment to CISCOs: Assignment without reasonable cause is reported to be common in the education sector, according to interviewees. It would often be imposed by the Ministry at the central level. Seen as a sanction by education personnel, it is a manifestation of favoritism, nepotism, abuse of power, and even retaliation. First, there are those who want to leave isolated areas and move to urban areas. To benefit from this urban rapprochement, corruption would be one of the safest and quickest means, through the payment of a bribe to the CISCO chief. Assignment would also be a means of pressure and coercion. The organization of pedagogical evaluations: official examinations of students. As soon as they register, some parents are said to be involved in influence peddling and offering bribes in order to benefit from various favours. During the delivery of examination papers, escorts refuse to perform their work without a cash payment of their allowances. Similarly, the DREN is requesting the (financial) "participation" of the CISCO chiefs for the cash payment of car rental costs to the service providers. When marking exam sheets, there are records of false grades for the institution to achieve good results with a high pass rate. This is also a case of influence peddling between teachers. Respect for free education as mentioned in the law is not guaranteed: there are still officials in schools who ask for money from the parents of pupils, which forces them to drop out and make them work early.*

### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- *The first obstacle is corruption, the widespread poverty of citizens, the illiteracy of the vast majority of citizens who cannot claim their right*

### **Transparency International Kenya**

- *Corruption, limited service points, non-responsiveness of service delivery agencies, bureaucracy - time taken to request and access the service.*
- *Improved responsiveness of agencies and provision of more service points that are closer to the population will reduce non-take up; in addition public education on how the public can press for more efficiency and responsiveness in public services as they pay for them.*

## **Resource availability**

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *Resource Constraints: Limited availability of resources, both financial and human, can lead to understaffing and underfunding of public service facilities, impacting the quality and availability of services.*
- *Lack of Awareness: Some citizens may not be fully informed about the services available to them, their entitlements, or how to access them, which limits their ability to benefit from the services provided.*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In Pakistan, several barriers hinder eligible individuals and households from accessing public services to which they are entitled, resulting in a phenomenon known as non-take-up. These barriers are multifaceted and encompass social, economic, and administrative challenges. To reduce non-take-up and ensure that eligible individuals benefit from public services, several strategies can be employed. Barriers to Accessing Public Services:*

- *Lack of Awareness: Many eligible individuals are unaware of the public services available to them. The government's outreach and public awareness efforts often fall short, leaving citizens uninformed about their entitlements.*

### **TI - Jordan:**

*Several barriers can hinder eligible individuals and households from accessing public services to which they are entitled in Jordan. These barriers can be both practical and systemic in nature. To reduce non-take-up and improve access, it is essential to address these barriers. Here are some common barriers and strategies to reduce non-take-up:*

*Barriers to Accessing Public Services:*

- *Lack of Information: Many individuals and households may not be aware of their entitlements or how to access public services.*

- *Financial Constraints: Some individuals may not have the means to cover out-of-pocket costs associated with accessing services or may be reluctant to pay bribes, which can be common in corrupt systems.*

*Strategies to Reduce Non-Take-Up:*

- *Public Awareness Campaigns: Implementing campaigns to inform individuals about their entitlements and how to access services can be effective in reducing the lack of information as a barrier.*
- *Financial Assistance: Introducing or expanding financial assistance programs can help low-income individuals overcome financial constraints associated with accessing services.*
- *Community Engagement: Involving local communities in the planning and delivery of services can increase awareness and trust, reducing non-take-up.*
- *Technology and E-Government: Utilizing technology to provide online access to services and information can make service delivery more efficient and accessible.*

**Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

*Barriers:*

- *Lack of Awareness: Many eligible individuals and households are not aware of the services available to them or do not fully understand their entitlements.*
- *Financial Constraints: Services may have associated costs, such as user fees, which can be a barrier for low-income individuals and households.*
- *Language and Literacy Barriers: Language diversity in Ghana can be a challenge, as some individuals may not understand official languages. Low literacy levels can also hinder service access.*

*Strategies:*

- *Awareness Campaigns: Launch public awareness campaigns to inform citizens about their entitlements and the availability of services. These campaigns should be culturally sensitive and accessible to all, including those with lower literacy levels.*
- *Remove Financial Barriers: Consider reducing or eliminating user fees for essential services, especially in healthcare and education, to make them more accessible to low-income populations.*
- *Improve Infrastructure: Invest in infrastructure development, particularly in rural areas, to ensure that services are physically accessible to all citizens.*
- *Citizen Engagement: Involve citizens in decision-making and service design processes to ensure that services meet their needs and preferences.*
- *Mobile and Digital Solutions: Expand digital services and mobile applications to improve access, particularly in remote areas. These can help bridge geographic disparities.*
- *Community Outreach: Conduct outreach programs and mobile service delivery to reach underserved populations and those who may not be able to access services easily.*

**TI España:**

*Barriers:*

- *The lack of adequate information about care, requirements or the functioning of the system itself can profoundly affect access to public services, especially in more rural areas.*

*To reduce non-attendance or non-use of public services, a series of measures should be taken, including:*

- *Design simple institutional advertising campaigns aimed at accessing these services, adapting to new technologies to reach the younger generations.*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

*The obstacles that prevent the population from accessing public services are many and varied:*

- *Financial: Given the low purchasing power and poverty rate of the Congolese in general in the face of the expensive nature of certain public services;*
- *Awareness-raising: In the absence of a systematic popularization of the texts and decisions of the Executive on access to public services, citizens are very little informed of their rights;*
- *Psychosis: In the absence of a specific legal regime clearly ensuring their protection, people are afraid to denounce the abuses they face in the face of public services because most often, the desire to make demands is subject to reprisals;*
- *Regular public awareness and information are essential to reducing non-take-up.*

### **Physical barriers – geographical accessibility and connectivity**

#### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *Geographical Accessibility: Particularly those in remote areas, face challenges in accessing public services due to inadequate infrastructure and transportation options, making it difficult to reach service centres.*
- *Technology and Connectivity: Inadequate digital literacy or access to technology can hinder citizens from utilizing online platforms or e-services, limiting their ability to access services efficiently.*

#### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

- *Geographical Inaccessibility: In remote and underserved areas, accessing public services can be challenging due to a lack of infrastructure and transportation options. This geographic barrier limits people's ability to physically reach service delivery points.*

#### **TI Jordan:**

*Barriers to Accessing Public Services:*

- *Geographic Barriers: Limited availability of services in rural or remote areas can make it challenging for residents to access public services.*

*Strategies to Reduce Non-Take-Up:*

- *Mobile and Outreach Services: Providing mobile clinics or outreach services to remote or underserved areas can help address geographic barriers.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Geographic Disparities: In Ghana, there are significant disparities in access to services between urban and rural areas. Rural populations often face greater challenges in accessing public services due to inadequate infrastructure and transportation.*

### **TI España:**

- *The distance to the centres where these services are offered and the lack of adequate transportation are physical barriers that can be the biggest impediment, as well as the restricted opening hours that make it impossible for people to go during their working day.*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *In addition, we can also mention poor management, insufficient infrastructure, and difficult access to certain rural areas as concerns that make public services inaccessible to vulnerable populations. All of these factors can affect the delivery of public services and make it difficult for citizens to access these public services that are essential to their well-being.*

## **Discrimination and exclusion**

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *Discrimination and Exclusion: Discrimination based on gender, or other factors can lead to unequal access to public services, disproportionately affecting marginalized and vulnerable populations. Individuals with health issues or disabilities may face challenges in physically accessing service centers due to lack of accessible infrastructure or limited support for their unique needs.*

*All citizens have rights and can access all public services. However, there are predetermined categories such a very vulnerable citizens who are fully dependent and supported by the Government. In Rwanda, despite significant progress in recent years, several barriers persist that hinder citizens from accessing the public services to which they are entitled. These barriers can be multifaceted and include:*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

- *Stigma and Discrimination Around Different Social Groups: Stigmatization and discrimination of transgenders, people with disabilities, particularly against marginalized groups, often dissuade them from seeking public services. They may fear prejudice or mistreatment when interacting with service provider.*

### **TI Jordan:**

*Barriers to Accessing Public Services:*

- *Cultural and Social Factors: Social norms, cultural stigma, or discrimination may discourage individuals, especially women or minority groups, from accessing certain services.*

*Strategies to Reduce Non-Take-Up:*

- *Cultural Sensitivity and Gender Equity: Designing services with cultural sensitivity and addressing gender disparities can encourage traditionally marginalized groups to access services.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

#### *Barriers:*

- *Stigma and Discrimination: In some cases, stigma or discrimination may prevent individuals, particularly marginalized groups, from accessing services like healthcare or social welfare.*

#### *Strategies:*

- *Cultural Sensitivity: Ensure that services are culturally sensitive and that staff are trained to address the needs of different ethnic and cultural groups.*

*By addressing these barriers and implementing these strategies, non-take-up of public services can be reduced, ensuring that all eligible individuals and households in Ghana can access the services to which they are entitled.*

### **TI España:**

#### *Barriers:*

- *Cultural barriers due to the deterrent effect produced by those services that are not culturally adapted to the specific needs of the most vulnerable groups translate into limited access to them.*

*To reduce non-attendance or non-use of public services, a series of measures should be taken, including:*

- *Design simple institutional advertising campaigns aimed at accessing these services, adapting to new technologies to reach the younger generations.*

**Please refer to challenges and good practices of public services delivery to persons belonging to groups in situations of vulnerability and marginalization including persons living in poverty, women and girls; children and youth; ethnic, national and linguistic minorities; persons with disabilities; indigenous peoples; migrants; and older persons.**

### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *In Kuwait, there is a large degree of preference for people with disabilities and important groups, whether at the governmental level or civil society organizations, are usually involved in amending some old laws that may deprive them of receiving services in general, but in general there is distinct interest for these groups. There are no marginalized groups, but corruption contributes greatly to financial gain from providing services of lower quality.*



### **Transparency International Defence & Security:**

- *Women and girls are particularly, albeit not exclusively, vulnerable to sexual forms of corruption. In the defence and security sectors, this would include corruption that involves the abuse of a position of authority to obtain sexual benefits by a defence or security official. Those heavily reliant on security forces for survival, e.g. in conflict situations or in refugee camps, in which the power imbalance is exceptionally strong and options to report and prosecute sexual forms of corruptions are highly limited, are especially at risk here.*

### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Vulnerable groups are somehow engaged when providing public services, but their plights are often not fully considered. Consultations do take place, but the findings are not often reflected in final decisions reached when providing public services. Schools, hospitals and other public facilities are beginning to be more accessible to persons with disabilities, but the pace is very slow.*

### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *There is a lack of effective communication and information directed towards marginalised people about public services and safeguards that are available to them to ensure accountability in case of non-compliance. Marginalised people often face obstacles that hinder access and accountability due to absence of specific anti-discriminatory law and lack of enforcement of existing laws. The accountability framework of various public services is, in many cases, not inclusive for marginalised groups. The linguistic, financial and technical predicaments and capabilities of marginalised groups are not often taken into account. Negative attitude and practices of a section of the service providers lead to marginalised people being discouraged from using whatever accountability structure is in place. They do not often get the expected results by filing complaints but instead face adverse reactions. [https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2021/report/Marginalised\\_Study\\_ES\\_English.pdf](https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2021/report/Marginalised_Study_ES_English.pdf) ; [https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2019/report/IPS-Dalit/Main\\_EN\\_IPS\\_and\\_Dalit\\_Study.pdf](https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2019/report/IPS-Dalit/Main_EN_IPS_and_Dalit_Study.pdf)*

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

- *The Rwandan government has been at the forefront of enacting laws and regulations aimed at protecting Rwandans' rights in a variety of public and private sector service domains. The Government of Rwanda has adopted regional and international treaties, conventions, and agreements that promote gender equality including but not limited to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979), Beijing Platform for Action (1995), the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000), Sustainable Development Goals (2015), Kampala Declaration on Sexual and Gender Based Violence (2011), Maputo Protocol to the African charter on human and peoples' rights on the rights of women in Africa (2003), and Solemn Declaration on Gender Equality in Africa (2004). Accessibility to essential services to vulnerable citizens: Rwanda built a social protection system that tackles poverty and inequality, enables the poor to move out of poverty, helps reduce vulnerability and protect people from shocks, helps improve health and education among all Rwandans, and contributes to economic growth. Rwanda has a range of social protection schemes offering regular cash transfers that can be accessed by persons with*

disabilities, including programs funded through general taxation, donor-funded schemes, and contributory schemes.

- *Healthcare accessibility: Rwanda has built a network of healthcare facilities with good geographic coverage with the aid of a reliable fleet of ambulances for pre-hospital and emergency care. From the community level up to the referral level, the healthcare packages have been specified for each level. In order to speed up the development of nutrition and food security initiatives, Rwanda has identified multisectoral approaches and coordination efforts as essential components. In order to complement the National Food and Nutrition Coordination Secretariat, which was established to help coordinate the country's efforts to reduce undernutrition, the government established a national early childhood development (ECD) program with a family-focused strategy to address child stunting in the country.*
- *Accessibility to education: The government has shown considerable commitment to the sector through various initiatives, including providing free and compulsory education for nine years of basic education. Free education is now being expanded to 12 years of education. The Government of Rwanda has developed a comprehensive School Feeding Policy for addressing child nutrition issues and increasing educational enrolment, retention, and performance. School Feeding has been an integral part of the government's strategy to address children's hunger during the school day and expand access to educational opportunities for disadvantaged children, particularly orphans and vulnerable school learners".*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In the context of Pakistan, the challenges and good practices in delivering public services to marginalized and vulnerable groups, including those living in poverty, women and girls, children and youth, ethnic minorities, persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples, migrants, and older persons, are shaped by a complex socio-cultural and economic landscape.*

#### *Challenges:*

- *Poverty: Poverty remains a pervasive challenge in Pakistan, affecting citizens access to basic services, including education, healthcare, and social support.*
- *Gender Disparities: Gender inequality is a deeply entrenched issue. Women and girls often face discrimination, limited access to education, and lack of decision-making power. This gender gap impacts their ability to access services and participate fully in society. In Pakistan, according to a United Nations report, 98.8 per cent of women in the poorest rural households are deprived of education, while only less than 3% of the 17–23 age group of girls have access to higher education.*
- *Children and Youth: Pakistan has a youthful population with 63% of population aged 15-30, but many children and youth face barriers to accessing education and healthcare services. Child labour, child marriages, and a lack of educational facilities hinder their development. Only 49% of youth is able to receive education.*
- *Persons with Disabilities: Persons with disabilities often struggle with physical and attitudinal barriers. A lack of accessible infrastructure, limited educational opportunities, and discrimination are some of the major causes impeding their access to services and employment.*

#### Good Practices:

- *BISP and Ehsaas Program: Pakistan's flagship poverty alleviation programs, the Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) and the Ehsaas Program, provide financial assistance and social protection to marginalized individuals and families, addressing the challenge of poverty.*
- *Women Empowerment Initiatives: Programs and initiatives aimed at empowering women economically and socially, such as the Women on Wheels project, have been launched in Punjab. These efforts work to enhance gender equality and access to public services for women and girls.*
- *Educational Reforms: Investments in the education sector, including scholarship programs and infrastructure development, are working to improve access to quality education for children and youth.*
- *Cultural and Linguistic Inclusivity: Some provinces in Pakistan, like Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, have taken steps to promote linguistic inclusivity by offering education in regional languages, addressing the language barrier faced by ethnic minorities.*
- *Accessibility for Persons with Disabilities: Pakistan's Disabled Persons (Employment and Rehabilitation) Ordinance 1981 mandates a quota for persons with disabilities in government jobs, improving their access to employment. Additionally, public infrastructure is gradually becoming more accessible.*

#### TI – Jordan:

*Certainly, when it comes to public service delivery for vulnerable and marginalized groups, including persons living in poverty, women and girls, children and youth, ethnic and linguistic minorities, persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples, migrants, and older persons, there are both challenges and good practices to consider:*

#### Challenges:

- *Discrimination: Vulnerable and marginalized groups often face discrimination and social stigma, making it difficult for them to access and benefit from public services.*
- *Limited Access to Information: These groups may lack access to information about available services or may not understand how to access them.*
- *Economic Barriers: Poverty can act as a significant barrier to accessing services, as vulnerable groups may not have the financial resources to cover associated costs.*
- *Language and Communication Barriers: Ethnic and linguistic minorities, as well as migrants, may face language barriers that hinder their ability to understand and communicate with service providers.*
- *Geographic Barriers: Those living in remote or underserved areas may struggle to access public services due to a lack of nearby facilities.*
- *Lack of Inclusivity: Public services may not be designed to accommodate the needs of persons with disabilities, older persons, or indigenous peoples, making them inaccessible.*

#### Good Practices:

- *Inclusive Policies: Governments can implement inclusive policies that ensure all citizens, including vulnerable groups, have equal access to services. This includes anti-discrimination and gender-sensitive policies.*

- *Awareness Campaigns: Public awareness campaigns can inform marginalized groups about their rights and entitlements and how to access services.*
- *Community Engagement: Involving local communities in the planning, delivery, and evaluation of services can help ensure that services meet the specific needs of marginalized groups.*
- *Targeted Outreach: Governments can establish outreach programs to provide services directly to remote or underserved areas, ensuring that marginalized populations can access them.*
- *Affordability Measures: Implementing subsidies or financial assistance programs can help mitigate economic barriers for individuals living in poverty.*
- *Language Access: Providing services in multiple languages and offering interpretation services can help ethnic and linguistic minorities and migrants overcome language barriers.*
- *Universal Design: Building public services with universal design principles in mind ensures that they are accessible to persons with disabilities and older persons.*
- *Cultural Competency Training: Ensuring that service providers are trained to be culturally competent can improve interactions with indigenous peoples and minority groups.*
- *Collecting Disaggregated Data: Governments can collect and analyse data that is disaggregated by gender, age, ethnicity, and other factors to identify and address disparities in service delivery.*
- *Partnerships: Collaboration with civil society organizations, NGOs, and international partners can amplify efforts to improve service delivery for marginalized populations.*

#### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *Women have more difficulties to gain access to institutions, particularly political ones, basic services (health, education, justice,...), decision- making positions, credits, obtaining authorizations, permits and licenses because of the corruption.*

#### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

##### *Challenges:*

- *Lack of awareness and understanding of the needs of vulnerable and marginalized groups among public service providers.*
- *Discrimination and stigma against certain groups, leading to unequal access to services.*
- *Limited access to education and training for vulnerable and marginalized groups, hindering their ability to access and benefit from services.*

##### *Good practices:*

- *Providing targeted support and resources to increase access to services for vulnerable and marginalized groups.*
- *Providing trainings to public service providers on the needs of vulnerable and marginalized groups.*
- *Encouraging collaboration between government agencies, civil society organizations, and community groups to ensure a holistic and coordinated approach to service delivery for these groups.*

*Challenges in providing public services to marginalized groups include lack of awareness, discrimination, and limited education. Good practices include increasing representation, providing targeted resources, educating service providers, and encouraging collaboration between agencies and organizations.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

*Though no specific exclusion of vulnerable populations from access to public services in Ghana have been identified, there still remains some unresolved challenges with flexibility of access and responsiveness to meet the needs of these populations. A study by the National Library on medicine identified a deficit in access to health and educational facilities in the country;*

*Findings on Health service delivery:*

- *Maternal healthcare services that are designed to address the needs of able-bodied women might lack the flexibility and responsiveness to meet the special maternity care needs of women with disability. More disability-related cultural competence and patient-centred training for healthcare providers as well as the provision of disability-friendly transport and healthcare facilities and services are needed. (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/>)*

*Findings on education delivery:*

- *The findings revealed that most of the building elements were barring and not disability friendly. Just to name a few: there were obstructions on access routes to and around buildings, absence of designated car parks, unfriendly vertical and horizontal means of circulation in buildings and lack of accessible sanitary accommodations. In addition, the general lighting and signage were poor. As a result, very few students with disabilities are admitted and retained in these schools. (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5442571/>)*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

*The Republic of Congo faces a large deficit in terms of access to public services throughout the country and for the entire population. Public services are not present in all departments, and decentralization is not really effective. In some localities there is a lack of all or almost all of them, such as:*

- *Health centres;*
- *Schools;*
- *Water and electricity;*
- *Means of communication...*

*Ethnic minorities, people living with disabilities, indigenous peoples... are increasingly marginalized and the Ministry of Social Affairs, which is supposed to take their grievances into account, is concentrating more of its action in the major centres. Congo does not have an effective social policy, especially with the so-called "black baby" phenomenon, so far there is no policy to re-educate and reintegrate these young people and make them useful to society.*

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *Corruption: Corruption is a major barrier to accessing public services, including healthcare. To reduce non-take-up, it is essential to fight corruption in the health sector. This can be accomplished by increasing transparency in the management of resources, protecting whistleblowers who report corruption, and prosecuting perpetrators of corruption. Accountability is essential to ensure that public funds are used wisely.*
- *Stigma: Certain populations, such as ethnic minorities, people living with HIV/AIDS, or people with mental illness, may be subject to stigma. To reduce non-take-up, it is essential to conduct awareness campaigns to combat stigma and promote inclusion. Health professionals also need to be trained to provide care that is sensitive to the needs of these populations.*

- *Poverty: Poverty is a major barrier to accessing public services. Direct costs, such as consultation fees, medications, and hospital care, as well as indirect costs, such as transportation costs, can be prohibitive for people living in poverty. To reduce non-take-up, it is necessary to put in place health financing mechanisms for the poorest, such as universal health coverage programmes and transport subsidies.*
- *Insufficient resources: Public health facilities in Madagascar may suffer from a lack of resources, resulting in shortages of medicines, medical equipment, and personnel. To reduce non-take-up, it is essential to increase investment in the health system, improve resource management, and ensure that health facilities have the necessary equipment and supplies.*
- *Accessibility: For many people, especially those living in rural areas, geographic accessibility of public services can be a barrier. It is important to improve transport infrastructure and set up mobile health systems to reach remote populations. Telemedicine and information technology can also be used to improve access to health care, especially in remote areas.*
- *Awareness: Education and awareness play a critical role in reducing non-use. Information campaigns about available health services, patients' rights, and the benefits of prevention and regular medical care can encourage people to seek health services.*
- *Community inclusion: Involving local communities in the planning, delivery, and monitoring of health services can promote better access. Community health committees and community health workers can play a key role in reducing non-use.*

*In summary, to reduce the non-use of public services to which they are entitled, it is essential to fight corruption, improve geographical accessibility, combat stigma, reduce costs for poor populations, increase investment in the health system, raise awareness, include local communities and improve the quality of services. Solutions require a holistic and coordinated approach, involving government, non-governmental organizations, health professionals and civil society to ensure that every citizen has equitable access to essential public services.*

#### **Transparency International Kenya**

- Challenges: corruption, bureaucracy, few service points/distance to service points.
- Good practices: digitisation, accessible and responsive public complaint systems; service charters.

**Are public services digitalized in your country? Please provide details including challenges and good practices in digitalization of public services that ensures transparency, accountability, and efficiency in the delivery of public services.**

#### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *There is a digital application (Saheel) that the government issued in 2021 and it is in great development, but the problems currently are in not including the services of some important parties to improve the business environment. Not all services have been added to the digital platform that the government recently launched in 2020, and services related to real estate registration and public tenders are not fully available on the digital platform. In addition, there is a lack of complete transparency in providing services and the failure of civil society to enable oversight.*



### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi:**

- *Groups living in vulnerable situations are forgotten and marginalised, so this has to change through action to change attitudes and these groups have to be integrated into access to public services.*

### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Yes, to an extent, public service are digitized. However, this is at a very small scale. The face to face nature of public service provision increases the risk of corruption, discretionary decision-making, among others, in Liberia.*

### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *Partially. Service delivery in the land sector have been partially digitized; Sub-district Digital Centres have been set up facilitating private entrepreneurship of some services at grassroots level. But much remains for these measures to be effective. [https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2019/report/land/Land\\_Registration\\_EX\\_EN.pdf](https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2019/report/land/Land_Registration_EX_EN.pdf); [https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2017/UDC/Full\\_Report\\_UDC\\_02122017.pdf](https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2017/UDC/Full_Report_UDC_02122017.pdf); <https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/articles/story/5905>.*

### **Transparency International Rwanda:**

*In Rwanda, there has been a significant push towards digitalizing public services to enhance transparency, accountability, and efficiency. This effort has encompassed various sectors, including taxes, immigration services, family status updates, national ID acquisition and replacement, land services, Community Based Health Insurance (Mutuelle), national police services, transport authorization, tourism licenses, and tourism.*

*The challenges and good practices associated with this digitalization include for example:*

- *Rwanda has implemented a digital tax collection system that allows citizens and businesses to pay their taxes online. This has streamlined the tax collection process, reducing the potential for corruption and improving efficiency. The challenge, however, lies in ensuring that all citizens, including those in rural areas, have access to the necessary technology and skills to use these digital services effectively.*
- *The digitalization of immigration services has made it more convenient for individuals to apply for visas and permits. It has also contributed to the transparency and efficiency of the immigration process, reducing opportunities for bribery or fraud. Challenges include ensuring the security of personal data and maintaining service accessibility for all, and ensuring that the system is user-friendly and accessible to all, especially in remote areas.*
- *Digital land registration and management systems have improved transparency in property transactions and reduced the potential for corruption. The main challenge here is to address historical land disputes and ensure the accuracy of the land registry.*

*Rwanda has made substantial progress in digitalizing public services to promote transparency, accountability, and efficiency. However, challenges related to the digital divide, data security, user-friendliness, and infrastructure must be continually addressed to ensure that these digital services*

*benefit all citizens and contribute to the country's overall development. As a solution the government has established digital shops where citizens are facilitated and can access these services.*

### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In Pakistan, the digitalization of public services has made significant progress, yet challenges persist. The transition to digital services aims to enhance transparency, accountability, and efficiency in public service delivery.*

#### *Challenges:*

- *Digital Divide: A significant portion of the population, more than 50%, particularly in rural areas, lacks access to digital devices and the internet. This digital divide can exclude many individuals from benefiting from digital public services.*
- *Limited Digital Literacy: Low levels of digital literacy can hinder people from effectively using digital services. Many individuals, especially in older age groups, are not familiar with digital technology.*
- *Bureaucratic Resistance: Resistance to change within bureaucratic structures can slow down the adoption of digital services. Some government officials may be hesitant to transition from traditional paper-based systems to digital platforms.*
- *Cybersecurity Concerns: The digitalization of public services brings concerns about cybersecurity. Ensuring the safety and privacy of citizens' data is crucial but challenging in a rapidly evolving digital landscape.*
- *Legal and Regulatory Frameworks: The legal and regulatory framework for digital services in Pakistan is still evolving. Clarity and consistency in these regulations are essential for effective digitalization.*

#### *Good Practices:*

- *Citizen Portal: The Pakistan Citizens' Portal, a mobile app, allows citizens to register complaints and provide feedback to government departments. It has become a valuable tool for accountability and transparency in public service delivery.*
- *Digital Identity: The National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA) has introduced digital identity cards and systems for citizens, which streamline access to various public services. This has helped reduce identity fraud and enhance efficiency.*
- *E-Government Initiatives: The government has launched various e-government initiatives, such as the Ehsaas Program, aimed at delivering social and financial assistance to vulnerable populations. These digital platforms enable more efficient service delivery and reduce corruption.*
- *Online Tax Filing: The Federal Board of Revenue (FBR) has introduced an online tax filing system that allows citizens to file their taxes digitally, promoting transparency and reducing tax evasion.*
- *Digital Payments: Digital payment platforms like JazzCash and Easypaisa have facilitated financial transactions and the disbursement of government subsidies and financial aid. This has reduced leakages in financial assistance programs.*
- *Education Technology: The COVID-19 pandemic accelerated the adoption of online education platforms in Pakistan. This digital transformation allowed students to access educational content remotely, addressing challenges in education delivery.*

- *Mobile Health Services: Mobile health services and telemedicine platforms have gained traction, providing remote healthcare consultations, especially in underserved rural areas.*
- *Government Portals: Websites and digital portals of various government departments provide information, services, and resources to citizens. These portals improve access to government services and information.*

## **TI - Jordan:**

*Jordan has been making efforts to digitalize public services, although the extent of digitalization and its impact on transparency, accountability, and efficiency may have evolved since then. Here are some details on the digitalization of public services in Jordan, along with associated challenges and good practices:*

### *Digitalization of Public Services in Jordan:*

#### *Challenges:*

- *Digital Divide: A significant challenge in digitalization is the digital divide, where not all citizens have access to the necessary technology and internet connectivity to fully benefit from digital services.*
- *Cybersecurity Concerns: As digital services expand, there is a need to ensure robust cybersecurity measures to protect sensitive data and maintain the trust of users.*
- *Capacity Building: Training and capacity building are essential for government employees and users to navigate digital platforms effectively.*
- *Data Privacy: Ensuring the privacy and security of citizens' data is crucial. Data protection and privacy laws need to be in place and enforced.*
- *User Trust: Building trust among the public is vital for the adoption of digital services. Citizens must feel confident that their data is handled securely.*

#### *Good Practices:*

- *E-Government Portals: Jordan has developed e-government portals like "e-Government Platform" that serve as centralized platforms for accessing a wide range of government services online.*
- *Digital Identity: The introduction of the "National Digital Identity" program has streamlined access to services and reduced the need for physical documents, enhancing efficiency.*
- *Online Payment Systems: The availability of secure online payment systems makes it easier for citizens to pay fees, taxes, and bills, reducing the need for physical visits to government offices.*
- *Transparency and Accountability: Digital platforms can provide transparency by offering access to government information and documents, making the government's activities more accountable.*
- *Mobile Apps: Mobile applications have been developed for services such as traffic ticket payments and municipal services, providing convenience for citizens.*
- *Digital Transformation Strategy: Jordan has introduced a Digital Transformation Strategy to guide the modernization and digitalization of public services.*
- *Collaboration with Private Sector: Public-private partnerships have been established to develop and maintain digital services, ensuring efficiency and innovation.*

- *Citizen Feedback Mechanisms: Feedback mechanisms, including online surveys and complaint forms, allow citizens to provide input and report issues related to public services.*
- *Data Analytics: The use of data analytics can help improve the efficiency and effectiveness of services by identifying trends and areas for improvement.*

#### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *Digitalization in Morocco is still at the beginning of the process and is among the demands of civil society.*

#### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

- *The Cambodian government has expressed its commitment to transforming the country into a digital economy. Some good practices in the digitalization of public services in Cambodia include the use of online citizen services such as online tax payment and online vehicle registration. However, there are still challenges to overcome in digitalizing public services in Cambodia. One major challenge is the lack of infrastructure and internet access in rural areas. There is also a need for capacity-building for government staff to effectively implement digital services. Furthermore, there are concerns regarding the security and privacy of personal information in the digital realm. It is important for the government to ensure that proper measures are in place to protect citizens' data.*

#### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

*The government has been actively promoting the adoption of digital technologies to enhance transparency, accountability, and efficiency in service delivery.*

- *E-Government Platforms: Ghana introduced e-government platforms that allow citizens to access various government and public services online. The Ghana e-Services Portal is a central platform for this purpose, offering services such as business registration, tax filing, and online payments.*
- *National Digital Property Address System: The National Digital Property Address System assigns unique digital addresses to every property in Ghana, making it easier to locate and access public services.*
- *Electronic Procurement (e-Procurement): The government has implemented an e-procurement system to enhance transparency in public procurement. This system helps streamline the procurement process and reduce opportunities for corruption.*
- *Mobile Money and Financial Inclusion: The adoption of mobile money services has expanded access to financial services, including the payment of fees for public services like utility bills, taxes, and social services.*
- *Birth Registration: The Births and Deaths Registry has introduced digital birth registration services to improve access to official identity documents, a crucial aspect of accessing public services.*

#### **Challenges:**

- *Digital Divide: Not all Ghanaians have access to the internet or digital devices, leading to a digital divide. Rural and low-income populations may face challenges accessing digital services.*

- *Cybersecurity Concerns: Ensuring the security of digital systems is crucial, as there are concerns about data breaches and cyber threats.*
- *Infrastructure Limitations: In rural areas, limited internet connectivity and inadequate power supply can hinder the effectiveness of digital services.*
- *Digital Literacy: Many citizens, especially in rural areas, may lack the digital literacy skills required to navigate and use online services effectively.*
- *Data Privacy: The collection and storage of personal data in digital systems raises concerns about data privacy and protection.*

*Good Practices:*

- *Interoperability: Implementing interoperable systems that allow different government agencies to share information and data can streamline services and improve efficiency.*
- *Feedback Mechanisms: Many digital platforms incorporate feedback mechanisms, allowing citizens to report issues or provide feedback on service quality and performance.*
- *Citizen Engagement: The government has actively engaged citizens in the design and implementation of digital services, ensuring that they meet the specific needs of the population.*
- *Transparency and Accountability: The use of digital systems, such as e-procurement, can enhance transparency by making procurement processes more visible and accountable.*
- *Digital Skills Training: Efforts to enhance digital literacy and skills among citizens are vital for the successful adoption of digital services.*
- *Regulatory Framework: Establishing a robust legal and regulatory framework for digital services helps protect data privacy and ensure the security of these systems.*

*The government of Ghana has in recent years piloted and implemented the usage of digital platforms in the delivery of public services. The project which began with several suspicions and oppositions have gained recognition as one of the profound initiatives to reduce the level of corruption and inefficiencies in most public institutions. The digitalization initiative spear-headed by the current government has been implemented in public institutions like the Ghana ports and harbour Authority, the Ghana Revenue Authority tax filing platform, the Office of the Registrar of Companies online registration and complaints platform, the use of the Biometric use of National Card to access most of the public services such as banking, Passport and Birth certificate acquisition among others are ongoing practices in the country.*

*The Ghana Audit Service also made this observation in its 2021 audit report on how the digitalization agenda is complimentary way to protecting the public purse; Digitalization of the economy would help protect the public purse - <https://audit.gov.gh/6/16/20/digitalization-of-the-economy-would-help-protect-the-public-purse>)*

*Notwithstanding these commendations, there still remains more room for improvement specifically with building staff capacity and public education on the means to accessing these public services.*

**TI España:**

*According to the DESI 2022 report, by the end of 2025, approximately 50% of digital public services should be available through mobile. In order to advance in the digital transformation of the General State Administration, the improvement in the provision of services in strategic areas of the same will also be addressed, also called "tractors" due to their capacity to pull the digitalisation of administrations and society in general, completing the digitalisation process initiated within the framework of Digital*

*Spain 2025 and extending this process to new areas, such as the Social Services and the Tax Agency: Among the main objectives mentioned are:*

- *to facilitate the digital transformation of central services of the General State Administration;*
- *simplifying citizens' relationship with public administrations and personalising digital public services; and*
- *updating the technological infrastructures of Public Administrations and integrating them into the digital transformation of the Public Sector.*

*Essentially, efforts will focus on the digital transformation of the following public services:*

- *Digital transformation of the Administration of Justice-Digital transformation of Public Employment Services-Digital transformation in the field of Inclusion, Social Security and Migration-Consular digitalisation plan-Digital transformation of social services*
- *Digital transformation of the Tax Agency and enhancement of taxpayer assistance*

*Promotion of other tractor projects:*

- *Among the main challenges is the exponential growth in the probability of suffering cyberattacks with the progressive increase in the digitalization of services. Cyber security is becoming more and more important every day.*
- *Equally important is the access to new technologies by sectors of society and the lack of knowledge of the platforms, methods and certificates used to access public services such as the e-ID card.*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH)**

- *The digitalization of public services in the Republic of Congo is not yet fully effective, the process is ongoing. In 2019, Congo launched a national strategy for the development of the digital economy by 2025 called "Congo Digital 2025" [https://www.undp.org/fr/congo/blog/Cette strategy aims to improve access to and quality of public services through information and communication technologies \(ICTs\)](https://www.undp.org/fr/congo/blog/Cette%20strategy%20aims%20to%20improve%20access%20to%20and%20quality%20of%20public%20services%20through%20information%20and%20communication%20technologies%20(ICTs)) The World Bank is also financing the digitalization of public services in the Republic of Congo <http://fr.africanews.com/2023/01/27/>*
- *The digitalization of the public service remains a major challenge in Congo. The observation shows that in most administrations, working conditions remain empirical, with paper archives instead of digital. A department such as the judiciary is particularly affected by this, particularly in the context of the establishment of criminal records and nationality certificates which, however sensitive these documents may be, are drawn up by hand in the absence of a reliable computerized database. Worse, it is difficult to find even data relating to judicial decisions, and particularly those related to the containment of corruption.*
- *Thus, a convicted offender can very easily be issued with a completely clean criminal record due to the lack of computerization of the judicial system. This situation significantly delays the delivery of administrative documents and documents, fuels corruption in public services and constitutes a serious security shortcoming. In the same vein, the Republic of the Congo has still not adopted a land registry illustrating the extent of the natural resource deposits that abound in its soil and subsoil, despite recommendations to that effect. Moreover, this mapping of mining, oil, gas and other resources would be highly timely and would provide the necessary facilities for any investor wishing to gain a foothold in the Congo.*
- *However, good practices lie in computerization, thanks to the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI), and the availability of the various contracts signed between Congo and most of the companies that exploit natural resources in the territory. In the same way, and again thanks*



to the EITI, certified farm income data is digitised and publicly available. This would be a guarantee of transparency and accountability if the public could take ownership of this data. Also, the Presidency of the Republic, as well as the Government, have had websites for some time, as well as most of the ministries attached to them. Aware of the challenges related to the emergence of a healthy and reliable digital economy, the Government has made it the fifth pillar of its National Development Plan (NDP) 2022-2026.

**Transparency International Madagascar:**

- *Digitalization is not yet on the cards for the education sector in Madagascar.*

**Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption(LICOCO DRC):**

- *Public services are not digitized in the DRC.*

**Transparency International Kenya**

- *Yes some. Digitisation reduces rent-seeking/corruption, and reduces the cost that would be incurred for people to travel to service points and time taken to access services, however, there are still challenges in internet access especially in rural areas that make it difficult to access digital platforms.*

**How is the participation of private actors in public service delivery regulated and monitored in your country/region? Please share challenges and good practices.**

**Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *Through the Public Tenders Committee, but the problem lies in the monopoly of some goods by some companies, and favouritism may be a deciding point in the selection mechanism. Through our own efforts and our continuous communication with many of those working in those agencies, and trying to put pressure through the press and Parliament to enable us to obtain sufficient information for evaluation, as well as submit reform proposals to those concerned.*

**Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *There are laws and regulations on this, but, like most laws and policies in Liberia, they are not fully implemented. And national government does little to sanction groups that contravene these policies.*

**Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *The gap between demand for services in sectors like education and health and supply from the public sector has been filled by fairly robust growth private sector institutions but that has happened in the absence of sufficient legal and policy structure to ensure transparency and accountability leading to various forms of corruption including extortive imposition of extremely high cost of services driven by profit motive holding the service recipients to hostage.*  
[https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2018/report/private\\_health/Ex\\_Sum\\_English\\_Private\\_Health.pdf](https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/images/2018/report/private_health/Ex_Sum_English_Private_Health.pdf);  
<https://www.ti-bangladesh.org/articles/story/4365>

## **Transparency International Rwanda:**

*In Rwanda, the participation of private actors in public service delivery is regulated and monitored through a combination of legal frameworks, regulatory bodies, and oversight mechanisms. The government has established a comprehensive system to ensure that private sector involvement aligns with national development goals and standards, these include:*

- *Legal Frameworks and Policies: Rwanda has established legal frameworks that govern public-private partnerships (PPPs) and private sector involvement in service delivery. Laws, such as the Law on Public-Private Partnerships and the Investment Code, provide guidelines for private sector engagement and partnerships.*
- *Regulatory Bodies: The Rwanda Development Board (RDB) serves as a central regulatory body responsible for promoting investments and overseeing the engagement of private actors. RDB facilitates the implementation of investment-related laws and regulations, ensuring compliance and fostering a conducive environment for private sector participation.*
- *Sector Specific Regulatory Authorities: In specific sectors, there are regulatory authorities that oversee private sector involvement. For instance, the Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority (RURA) regulates utility services like energy, water, and telecommunications, ensuring fair practices and service quality.*
- *Public-Private Dialogue and Coordination: The government promotes dialogue and collaboration between the public and private sectors through platforms like the Rwanda Private Sector Federation. This facilitates engagement, policy discussions, and addressing challenges related to private sector involvement in public service delivery.*

*By combining legal frameworks, regulatory oversight, public-private dialogue, contractual agreements, financial oversight, and impact assessments, Rwanda ensures that private sector involvement in public service delivery aligns with national objectives and benefits the citizens effectively and responsibly.*

## **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In Pakistan, the participation of private actors in public service delivery is regulated and monitored through a combination of legal frameworks, oversight mechanisms, and regulatory bodies. This approach is essential to address the challenges of providing efficient and accessible public services while ensuring accountability and transparency. However, it also faces significant challenges and has seen some good practices. During floods 2023, NGO and Charity Organizations considered working effectively, by 62% of survey-takers according to NCPS 2022.*

*Regulation and Monitoring:*

- *Legal Frameworks: The regulatory framework in Pakistan is primarily based on laws and regulations that govern various sectors, such as education, healthcare, and utilities. These laws define the roles and responsibilities of private actors and public authorities.*
- *Regulatory Bodies: Several regulatory bodies oversee the activities of private actors in public service delivery. For example, the Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA) regulates the telecom sector, ensuring fair competition and quality services.*
- *Public-Private Partnership (PPP) Models: Pakistan has increasingly turned to PPP models for public service delivery, especially in infrastructure development. These agreements outline the responsibilities of both public and private entities and are subject to scrutiny.*

### Challenges:

- *Corruption: One of the significant challenges in regulating private actors in public service delivery is corruption. The lack of transparency and accountability can lead to kickbacks and bribery, undermining the intended benefits of private sector involvement.*
- *Quality Control: Maintaining service quality is another challenge. Private actors might prioritize profits over service quality, leading to subpar services, particularly in sectors like healthcare and education.*
- *Access and Equity: Ensuring equitable access to services remains a challenge. The private sector may focus on urban areas and neglect marginalized regions where the need for services is often greater.*
- *Regulatory Capacity: Regulatory bodies may lack the capacity and resources to effectively monitor and enforce regulations. This can lead to non-compliance and irregularities.*
- *Lack of Transparency: Transparency in decision-making and contract negotiations can be lacking, making it difficult for citizens to know the terms of public-private partnerships and the financial arrangements involved.*

### Good Practices:

- *Social Accountability Initiatives: Civil society organizations and NGOs in Pakistan play a vital role in monitoring and advocating for accountability in public service delivery. They use methods such as community scorecards and social audits to hold both public and private actors accountable.*
- *Public Disclosure and Participation: Increasing transparency through public disclosure of contracts and involving citizens in decision-making processes can help mitigate some of the challenges related to corruption and lack of transparency.*
- *Independent Regulators: Strengthening regulatory bodies' independence and capacity can improve oversight and enforcement of regulations. These regulators should be well-funded and staffed by experts in the relevant sectors.*

## TI - Jordan:

### Challenges:

- *Regulatory Capacity: Ensuring that regulatory bodies have the necessary expertise, resources, and capacity to effectively oversee private sector participation can be challenging.*
- *Corruption Risk: The involvement of private actors can pose corruption risks, which must be actively managed and mitigated through robust anti-corruption measures.*
- *Transparency and Disclosure: Achieving full transparency in PPP agreements and disclosing relevant information can be a challenge, as some private actors may seek confidentiality.*
- *Monitoring and Evaluation: Ensuring that performance monitoring is consistent, rigorous, and results-driven can be demanding for regulatory bodies, especially in sectors with complex service delivery.*

### Good Practices:

- *Clear Legal Framework: A well-defined legal framework that establishes the roles and responsibilities of private actors, regulatory bodies, and government agencies is crucial for effective regulation.*
- *Public-Private Dialogue: Encouraging open and ongoing dialogue between the public and private sectors fosters collaboration, addresses concerns, and builds trust.*
- *Risk Allocation: Clear identification and allocation of risks in PPP agreements are essential. Risk-sharing mechanisms can be designed to protect the interests of both parties.*
- *Regular Reporting: Requiring regular reporting and performance evaluations ensures that private actors remain accountable and meet their contractual obligations.*
- *Capacity Building: Investing in the capacity of regulatory authorities and government agencies to understand and effectively manage PPPs is important for their success.*
- *Safeguarding Transparency: Ensuring that transparency is a non-negotiable component of PPP contracts and agreements, with a focus on disclosure and public access to information, can reduce corruption risks.*
- *Stakeholder Engagement: Involving civil society, communities, and relevant stakeholders in the decision-making and oversight processes enhances accountability and public confidence.*

### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *The private sector is increasingly present in the provision of public services, but outside of efficient control by the authorities, which leaves it free rein for fraudulent practices and prices that are sometimes inaccessible to a majority of citizens.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

*In Ghana, the participation of private actors in public service delivery is regulated and monitored through a combination of legal frameworks, oversight mechanisms, and regulatory agencies. Private sector involvement is encouraged in various sectors, including healthcare, education, infrastructure, and utilities. Here are some insights into how this participation is regulated and monitored, along with associated challenges and good practices:*

#### *Regulation and Monitoring:*

- *Laws and Regulations: Ghana has laws and regulations that govern public-private partnerships (PPPs) and private sector involvement in public service delivery. These include the Public-Private Partnership Act of 2020, which provides the legal framework for PPP projects.*
- *Regulatory Agencies: Various regulatory agencies oversee private sector participation in specific sectors. For instance, the Ghana Health Service and the National Health Insurance Authority regulate private healthcare providers and insurance companies in the healthcare sector.*
- *Contractual Agreements: Public-private partnerships often involve contractual agreements that define the roles and responsibilities of private actors. These contracts are scrutinized and approved by relevant government agencies.*
- *Performance Monitoring: The government monitors the performance of private service providers through key performance indicators (KPIs) and regular assessments. Non-compliance with agreed-upon standards can lead to penalties or contract termination.*
- *Transparency and Reporting: Transparency is emphasized, with private sector entities required to provide regular reports on their operations and financial performance. These reports are subject to auditing and scrutiny by relevant government bodies.*

#### *Challenges:*

- *Regulatory Gaps: In some cases, regulatory frameworks may be incomplete or have gaps, leading to challenges in ensuring effective oversight and accountability.*
- *Capacity Constraints: Regulatory agencies may lack the resources and capacity to adequately monitor and regulate private sector involvement in service delivery.*
- *Contract Enforcement: Ensuring that private sector entities comply with contractual obligations can be a challenge, and disputes may arise over contract terms and enforcement.*
- *Quality Control: Maintaining quality standards in services delivered by private actors can be a concern, especially in sectors like education and healthcare.*
- *Risk of Corruption: The involvement of private actors can carry a risk of corruption, and monitoring and oversight are essential to mitigate this risk.*

#### *Good Practices:*

- *Clear Regulatory Framework: The existence of a clear and comprehensive regulatory framework, as seen in the Public-Private Partnership Act, is essential for effective governance of private sector participation.*
- *Transparency and Disclosure: Ensuring transparency in the procurement process, contract terms, and financial reporting helps build trust and accountability.*
- *Public Engagement: Involving citizens and stakeholders in the planning and decision-making process regarding private sector participation fosters accountability and buy-in.*
- *Performance-Based Contracts: Implementing performance-based contracts that link payment to service delivery standards and outcomes can incentivize private actors to meet performance targets.*
- *Monitoring and Evaluation: Rigorous monitoring and evaluation mechanisms help track the performance of private sector providers and identify areas for improvement.*
- *Capacity Building: Building the capacity of regulatory agencies and personnel to effectively oversee private sector involvement is crucial.*
- *Dispute Resolution Mechanisms: Establishing clear mechanisms for resolving disputes between the public sector and private partners can help maintain the integrity of contracts.*

*There are laws and regulations that regulate Private service providers in Ghana. Mention can be made of PART ONE of the Health Institutions and Facilities Act, 2011 (Act 829) which created the Health Facilities Regulatory Agency (HeFRA). HeFRA was established to grant licenses to establishments that offer both private and public health care services. Also, reference can be made to Private Health Sector Development Policy. The largest providers of Health Services in Ghana after the state is the Christian Health Association of Ghana (CHAG). One of their main concerns has been delays in receiving payment from the Health Insurance Authority. These delays has necessitate their period refusal to accept the Health Insurance Card for services hence the return to the days of cash and carry.*

#### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *This participation takes place within the framework of the public-private partnership, in the name of which the State can concede the management of a public service to a private actor. It is governed by Law No. 88-2022 of 30 December 2022 on public-private partnership contracts. This text, which is intended to define the legal and institutional framework for public-private partnership contracts, is still very recent. The Public Procurement Code also regulates business between the private sector and the State in the provision of public services; However, the practical implementation of these laws, while ambitious, poses problems in practice.*

### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

*In the DRC, private actors are involved in the delivery of public services, particularly in the health and education sectors. In these two sectors, the private sector is only doing business to the detriment of helping the poorest. As a result, people who are vulnerable or at risk of discrimination cannot access private services because they do not have the financial means*

### **Transparency International Kenya**

- *Not well regulated*

**Describe economic policies, legislation, promising practices, or strategies and national, regional or local processes aimed at:**

- **increasing social spending, through national and local budgets, for the provision of public services;**
- **addressing structural discrimination in the provision of public services;**
- **maximizing available resources for the provision of public services;**
- **preventing corruption and associated illicit financial flows in the provision of public services;**
- **reallocating public expenditure for the provision of public services**
- **improving good governance in land administration**

### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *The government's work program for 2023-2033 includes many promising directions in terms of improving the level of income, increasing the efficiency and quality of public services, searching for alternative sources of revenues, and expanding the mechanism of monitoring and popular participation, and we are continuing to monitor the implementation of that plan. All previous options were part of the government's work program.*

### **ABUCO-Transparency International Burundi:**

- *In the general State budget, the amount allocated to public services is very minimal, and anti-corruption legislation is lacking when it comes to illicit financial flows in public services.*

### **Transparency International Defence & Security:**

*Priorities for addressing illicit financial flows in the defence and security sectors, to end illicit finance as a catalyst and an enabler of conflict and human insecurity, include:*



- *Strengthening beneficial ownership transparency, including for private military and security companies, as the Wagner group is an example of how illicit financial networks can combine with military activity to pose a threat to national and international security.*
- *Enhancing the ability of financial crime authorities to investigate and detect illicit financial flows. Global banks and money transfer providers also play a key role.*
- *Cooperation and information-sharing between 'source' and 'destination' countries is vital: tackling illicit finance requires global partnerships for a global problem.*

#### **Transparency International Bangladesh:**

- *Perspective Plan 2021-41; Anti-corruption Law 2004, Right to Information Law 2009, Anti-money Laundering Act 2012, National Integrity Strategy 2012; Guidelines on social safety net programmes; Digitalization of the service sector (ongoing).*

#### **Transparency International Pakistan:**

*In Pakistan, increasing social spending for public services has been a key policy priority. The government allocates a significant portion of its budget to sectors like education, healthcare, and social protection. For instance, the Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) provides financial assistance to low-income households, contributing to increased social spending and welfare support. Additionally, provinces also allocate resources for education and health services through their own budgets.*

- *Addressing Structural Discrimination: To address structural discrimination in public service provision, Pakistan has introduced several legislative measures and initiatives. Affirmative action programs aim to provide marginalized groups, including women and minority communities, with improved access to public services. Legislation such as the Punjab Protection of Women against Violence Act 2016, and the Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013, seek to protect vulnerable groups from discrimination and violence.*
- *Maximizing Available Resources: Efforts to maximize available resources for public services include expanding the tax base, reducing tax evasion, and improving revenue collection. Pakistan introduced the Benami Transactions (Prohibition) Act to curb illegal property holdings and tax evasion. Additionally, measures like the Single National Tax (SNT) have been implemented to streamline and simplify the tax collection process, making more resources available for public services.*
- *Preventing Corruption and Illicit Financial Flows: Corruption in public service provision remains a significant concern in Pakistan. To prevent corruption and associated illicit financial flows, there is a need to enhance the capacity of anti-corruption agencies like the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) and the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) to investigate and prosecute corrupt practices. Additionally, the Access to Information laws are there but the implementation remains weak.*
- *Reallocating Public Expenditure: Reallocating public expenditure for public services is an ongoing process in Pakistan. Efforts are being made to shift funds from non-essential areas to key sectors like education and healthcare. This is achieved through budgetary reforms and prioritizing the allocation of resources to sectors with the most significant public service impact. For example, the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province initiated a Citizen's Budget to increase transparency in budget allocations, allowing citizens to understand how public funds are allocated.*

- *Improving Good Governance in Land Administration: Land administration in Pakistan has historically been associated with governance challenges, including corruption. To improve good governance in land administration, the government introduced computerization and digitization of land records in several provinces, making the process more transparent and reducing opportunities for corrupt practices. In Punjab, the Land Records Management and Information Systems (LRMIS) project has been particularly successful in this regard. Moreover, the establishment of land dispute resolution committees in rural areas aims to provide accessible and efficient dispute resolution mechanisms, reducing the chances of corruption.*

#### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *Moroccan legislation in the fight against corruption, tax fraud, money laundering is considered to be well advanced legislation. But the problem in our country is related to the application of these laws which far from being efficient and effective. effective as well as the impunity which hinders the entire process relating to sustainable development and equal access of citizens to public services.*

#### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

- *Increasing social spending: Cambodia has implemented several policies and strategies to increase social spending, particularly in the provision of public services. The country's national budget has been steadily increasing, with a focus on social sector spending, such as education, health, and social welfare programs. Additionally, the government has established a social protection system called "ID Poor," which identifies poor households and provides them with targeted social assistance. The government has also collaborated with international organizations to implement social protection programs, such as the Cash Transfer Program for Orphans and Vulnerable Children.*
- *Addressing structural discrimination: Discrimination remains a significant issue in Cambodia, especially concerning access to public services for marginalized populations such as women, ethnic minorities, and people with disabilities. To address this issue, the government has established legal frameworks and policies to promote equal access to public services. Additionally, the government has established a national policy on gender equality and has developed strategies to address the specific needs of marginalized groups.*
- *Maximizing available resources: Cambodia has adopted several strategies to maximize resources for the provision of public services. One such strategy is the decentralization of administrative functions, which has allowed for greater local control over resource allocation and service provision.*
- *Preventing corruption: Corruption remains a challenge in Cambodia, particularly in the provision of public services. To address this issue, the government has implemented several anti-corruption measures and established institutions to combat corruption. For example, the Anti-Corruption Unit, established in 2010, has the authority to investigate and prosecute corruption cases. The government has also implemented public financial management reforms to increase transparency and accountability in the use of public funds.*
- *Reallocating public expenditure: The Cambodian government has implemented policies and strategies to increase social spending, establish legal frameworks to address discrimination in public services, adopt strategies to maximize available resources, implement anti-corruption measures, and reallocate public expenditure towards public services. Examples of such strategies include the social protection system ID Poor, National Social Security Fund, public-*

private partnerships, and the Anti-Corruption Unit. The national development plan prioritizes poverty reduction and social inclusion.

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *Fiscal Policy and Budget Allocations: Budget Prioritization: The government has been focusing on allocating a significant portion of the national budget to social sectors, including healthcare, education, and social welfare programs.*
- *Pro-Poor Policies: Implementation of pro-poor policies aims to address the needs of marginalized populations through targeted social spending.*
- *Social Intervention Programs: Free Senior High School (SHS) Program: The Free SHS policy aims to increase access to education by eliminating tuition and other fees, ensuring that education is accessible to all eligible students.*
- *National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS): The NHIS provides health insurance to Ghanaians, promoting affordable healthcare access and reducing out-of-pocket expenses.*
- *Legislation and Regulations: National Health Insurance Act: The NHIS is governed by legislation that ensures the sustainability and effectiveness of the health insurance system. Local Government Act: This legislation empowers local governments to allocate resources and make decisions regarding local service provision. Regional and Local Budget Planning: Local Government Budgeting: Decentralized planning and budgeting at the district and municipal levels have allowed for more tailored and region-specific allocations to address local needs.*
- *Community Engagement: Local communities participate in the budgeting process through town hall meetings and other mechanisms to prioritize and advocate for specific social services.*
- *Targeted Poverty Reduction Programs: Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty (LEAP): LEAP provides cash transfers to vulnerable and extremely poor households to improve their well-being.*
- *Digital Innovations and Financial Inclusion: Mobile Money Initiatives: Ghana's growing mobile money infrastructure has been utilized to disburse social welfare benefits, making the transfer of funds more efficient and inclusive.*
- *External Support and Donor Funding: Ghana has received external support and donor funding for specific social programs and projects, which can supplement the national and local budgets for social spending.*
- *Social Accountability Mechanisms: Civil society organizations, advocacy groups, and NGOs play an active role in monitoring budget allocations, ensuring that social spending is effectively channelled into public service delivery.*

*Challenges: Despite increased social spending, Ghana faces challenges in revenue mobilization, which can limit the government's ability to expand social services further. Ensuring equitable resource allocation across regions and districts remains a challenge as disparities persist in terms of access to public services.*

- *Fiscal Sustainability: Maintaining the long-term fiscal sustainability of social programs like the NHIS is crucial to preventing financial deficits.*
- *Promising Practices and Future Directions: Ghana's commitment to expanding access to education, healthcare, and social welfare programs underscores a promising commitment to social spending.*
- *Digital innovations in fund disbursement and service delivery have the potential to enhance efficiency and transparency.*

- *Improving good governance in land administration is a critical goal in Ghana, and various economic policies, legislation, promising practices, and strategies have been employed to address this issue.*
- *National Land Policy: Ghana has a comprehensive National Land Policy that provides a strategic framework for land administration, management, and governance. This policy outlines the principles of equitable land distribution and sustainable land use.*
- *Land Administration Law: The Land Administration Act, 2020 (Act 1036) modernizes and streamlines land administration processes. The new Act consolidates and harmonizes the existing laws on land and land administration into a single Act to ensure sustainable land administration, management, and effective land tenure.*
- *The Livelihood Empowerment against Poverty (LEAP) initiative helps severely poor households in Ghana by giving them cash and health insurance. This helps to promote long-term human capital development while also reducing short-term poverty.*

*After launching a trial period in March 2008, LEAP progressively expanded between 2009 and 2010. Over, 90,000 homes in Ghana are reached by the programme as of early 2015 (Source: <https://transfer.cpc.unc.edu/countries/ghana/>)*

- *The Constitution of Ghana provided for Free Universal Basic Education to address structural discrimination in Ghana's basic educational system. Ghana ranked seventh in all of sub-Saharan Africa for gender equity in education in 2019 with a score of 61%. The gender parity ratio at the point of completion is 68 girls to every 100 boys. With the introduction of the Free Compulsory Basic Education in 2005, reports from the education sector place Ghana is near gender parity at the basic levels of education.*
- *The new oil found in Ghana was seen as the country's opportunity to access additional resources to increase the provision of public service. Through the Petroleum Revenue Management Act, of 2017, an Annual Budget Funding Amount (ABFA) which is subject to the approval of Parliament is made available for the provision of public services. The provision of the PRMA notwithstanding, monitoring reports of the Public Interest and Accountability Committee (PIAC) show massive abuse of the resources.*
- *There has been the establishment of strong institutions to fight corruption and IFFs. Key among the institutions are the Financial Intelligence Centre (FIC), the Economic and Organised Crime Office (EOCO), and the Office of the Special Prosecutor (OSP).*
- *In addition to the establishment of institutions, a number of legislation have been passed. Mention can be made of the Right to Information Act, Witness Protection Act, Beneficial Ownership Clauses in the new Company's Act, Public Procurement (Amended) Act, and tightening the sanctioning regime of corruption (when found guilty, the accused could be sentenced for up to 25 years imprisonment)*
- *The government during the time of the pandemic, resources were channeled to the health service to save lives.*
- *Ghana has just passed a new Land Commission Act. The objective of the Act is to revise, harmonise and consolidate the laws on land to ensure sustainable land administration and management, effective and efficient land tenure, and to provide for related matters.*

#### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *The National Development Plan (NDP) 2022-2026- The Public Procurement Code- The Law on Transparency and Accountability in the Management of Public Finances- Law No. 9-2022 of 11*

### **Transparency International Madagascar:**

#### *Increase social spending:*

- *National and local budgets: Allocate a larger share of the national and local budget to essential public services, such as education, health care, housing, and social protection. This requires rigorous budget planning and prioritization of social sectors.*
- *Resource mobilization: Explore alternative sources of financing, such as public-private partnerships, special taxes, taxes on extractive industries, and international aid to support social spending.*
- *Budget transparency: Ensure transparency in budget processes, allowing the public to track resource allocation and assess the effectiveness of social spending.*
- *Fighting discrimination: Training and awareness-raising: Train professionals in health, education and other public services on non-discrimination and providing equitable care to all citizens, regardless of ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, etc. It is also important to inform citizens of their health rights so that they can demand a quality health care service.*

#### *Preventing corruption:*

- *Transparency and accountability: Promoting transparency in the management of public resources through access to information.*
- *Reporting mechanisms on: Establishing reporting mechanisms for acts of corruption and protecting citizens from reprisals.*
- *Strengthening the judicial system: Ensure that the judiciary is able to investigate and prosecute perpetrators of corruption.*

### **Ligue Congolaise De Lutte Contre La Corruption (LICOCO DRC):**

- *With regard to education, for example, with free basic education, the budget allocated to education in the DRC has increased by 5% since 2019. Teachers' salaries have increased by 3% but this has no impact because at the same time, the cost of living has increased by more than 10% over the same period. As a result, this increase in teachers' salaries does not affect the improvement in their standard of living.*
- *However, with corruption and poor governance in the education sector, for example, free basic education has had an impact on access to basic education for many school-age children, but due to a lack of school infrastructure, these children do not go to school. Since 2020, the Government has launched a program to build more than 1500 schools throughout the DRC and I believe that if the program is well executed, it will solve the problem of school infrastructure in the DRC; As far as the health sector is concerned, there is still a lot to be done because corruption does not allow citizens to access health care services. In 2020, the Government launched a programme to build more than 1000 health centres. The Government should solve the problem of recruitment, supply of medicines and have a sectoral policy to combat corruption in the health sector.*



## Other comments or inputs not covered above.

### **Kuwait Transparency Society:**

- *We tried to treat many problems in government services, as well as democratic reform, during our struggle in previous years with Parliament and the government, but the problem lies in that when we are convinced to issue legislation to treat these problems, this legislation is issued without quality and is incomplete, and we suffer once again in our campaign to try to reform. The defect.*

### **Center for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia (CENTAL):**

- *Corruption is a major impediment to good quality, gender responsive, and sustainable public service delivery in Liberia. Addressing it will be a key factor in helping to improve the quality and adequacy of public services in the country.*

### **Transparency Maroc:**

- *Urgent need to implement concrete actions to limit corruption, in all its forms, in areas directly related to the daily lives of populations and their interests, in courts, police services, public hospitals, administrations.*

### **Transparency International Cambodia:**

- *Overall, it is worth noting that while Cambodia has made some progress in improving public services, there are still significant challenges that need to be addressed. For example, the concerns about the quality of education and healthcare, as well as the high level of out-of-pocket spending for health services. While the government has implemented policies to promote equal access and increase resources for public services, there is still a need for continued investment and sustained efforts to realize these goals.*

### **Ghana Integrity Initiative:**

- *While some progress has been made, a lot needs to be done as a considerable number of Ghana's population still lack access to basic services. Thus, addressing gaps in access to basic services should be an urgent policy priority.*

### **Rencontre pour la Paix et les Droits de l'Homme (RPDH):**

- *Congo is a party to most international and regional human rights and anti-corruption conventions. The country has also adopted several pieces of legislation with the aim of internalizing these commitments. However, these steps serve more to improve the country's brand image towards foreign partners. The practice is quite far from these ambitions, given the impunity guaranteed to the perpetrators of violations, the systematized corruption, the grand corruption whose perpetrators are the officials of the executive and their cronies, with a judicial system totally directed by this executive, the absence of the rule of law enshrines these phenomena, so much so that public services suffer considerably, especially to the detriment of the majority of the poor population in a country rich in natural resources, as well as vulnerable and marginalized groups. Support for an effective rule of law would go hand in hand with the*



*fight against corruption, which are the main triggers for ensuring the effective exercise of human rights.*

## Transparency International's Body of Literature on Inclusive Public Service Delivery

Transparency International has produced a rich body of literature on topics such as public service delivery and inclusion, and the intersection of corruption with them. These include, but are not limited to:

- Transparency International. 2010. [Gender and Corruption in Service Delivery: The Unequal Impacts.](#)
- Transparency International. 2016. [Gender and Corruption: Topic Guide.](#)
- Transparency International. 2017. [Corruption In Service Delivery: Topic Guide.](#)
- Transparency International. 2018. [Gendered Land Corruption and the Sustainable Development Goals.](#)
- Transparency International. 2019. [Combating Land Corruption in Africa: Good Practice Examples.](#)
- Transparency International, Equal Rights Trust. 2021. [Defying Exclusion.](#)

Some findings of note from these reports include:

*"Corruption in service delivery is the form of corruption most frequently encountered by citizens, and can plague all kinds of interactions with the state. According to Transparency International's 2013 Global Corruption Barometer, 27 per cent of respondents worldwide claimed they had experienced corruption while dealing with a public service provider. This primarily affects marginalised and vulnerable groups, as wealthier, more powerful groups of society are less reliant on state assistance. As such, corruption undermines the "redistributionary" nature of public services, distorts policy decisions away from the public interest and diverts available public resources into the hands of corrupt groups inside, outside and straddling the state apparatus. By undermining the quality and quantity of public services, this type of corruption can fatally erode citizens' confidence in public institutions and ultimately undermine political stability, as reflected by studies that have found a correlation between civil unrest and low-quality service supply."<sup>3</sup>*

*"Certain forms of corruption in service delivery (such as clientelism, patronage, bribery) undermine the human right of equal access to public services, and exacerbate fundamental inequalities that violate citizens access, affecting the most marginalised and underrepresented segments of the population the most. Moreover, rampant corruption can lead to breakdowns in the service delivery chain, rendering the state apparatus incapable of meeting its obligations to safeguard its citizens, with catastrophic consequences such as famine and lack of basic medical supplies. Inability or unwillingness to curb corruption can therefore be seen as a failure by states to adequately provide for human rights – civil, political, economic, social and cultural, as well as the right to development – by depriving citizens access to public services. This creates a greater divide and inequality in society as the wealthy can afford private services. There is, therefore, a compelling argument to consider the fight against corruption in service delivery as an integral part of the human rights-based approach to development."<sup>4</sup>*

*"Corruption undermines the quantity and quality of public goods and restricts access to critical public services. Corruption's discriminatory nature means that the poor and marginalised are*

---

<sup>3</sup> Transparency International. 2017. Corruption In Service Delivery: Topic Guide. P.4.

<sup>4</sup> Transparency International. 2017. Corruption In Service Delivery: Topic Guide. P.4.

*disproportionately affected by the way corruption restricts economic growth, increases inequality and skews resource distribution.”<sup>5</sup>*

*“In addition, as a result of societal norms, women are frequently more exposed to higher corruption risks in areas of activity determined by stereotypical gender social roles and specific needs. As primary caregivers for children and the elderly in most regions of the world, and due to gender-specific needs in their reproductive years, women interact with health and education services more often than men do and are thus more likely to encounter corruption in public service delivery.”<sup>6</sup>*

*“Women and girls encounter coercive sexual demands to obtain land, a business permit, a work permit, public housing or even good grades. The Global Corruption Barometer (GCB) shows that in Latin America, the Caribbean, the Middle East and North Africa, one in five people has experienced or knows someone who has experienced sexual extortion when accessing government services such as health care or education. [A] anecdotal evidence suggests that sextortion has severe psychological, physical, economic and social impacts on survivors. These include dropping out of school, unwanted pregnancy, leaving a well-paid job or forgoing public services to avoid exposure to further abuse.”<sup>7</sup>*

---

<sup>5</sup> Transparency International and Equal Rights Trust. 2021. *Defying Exclusion*. p. 17.

<sup>6</sup> Transparency International and Equal Rights Trust. 2021. *Defying Exclusion*. p. 24.

<sup>7</sup> Transparency International and Equal Rights Trust. 2021. *Defying Exclusion*. p. 25.